DOUBTS ABOUT THE HADITH OF AL-THAQALAYN: A SUNNI AND SHIA PERSPECTIVE

Maghza Rizaka[1], Ferdy Pratama[2], Imam Ghazali Said[3]
[1-3] Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel, Surabaya, Indonesia
maghza.soebari@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The Hadith of *al-Thaqalayn* is one of the most significant hadiths in Islamic literature, particularly within Sunni and Shia traditions. This hadith states that the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) left behind two important things: the Qur'an and the *Ahlul Bayt*. This study examines various versions of the Hadith of *al-Thaqalayn* to determine its authenticity, interpretation, and implications for leadership in Islam. By comparing primary sources such as Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim and *Uṣūl al-Kāfī*, along with secondary literature, this research employs content analysis to identify textual variations, address doubts, and assess scholarly criticism of the Hadith of *al-Thaqalayn*. The findings reveal that despite differences in interpretation, both Sunni and Shia traditions emphasize the importance of adhering to the Qur'an and the Sunnah as the primary guides. The study also highlights the complexity of assessing the reliability of hadiths, demonstrating that even though some chains of transmission may be considered weak, the core message of adhering to the Qur'an and the teachings of the Prophet Muhammad remains vital. Additionally, the analysis discusses theological debates regarding the role of the *Ahlul Bayt* and provides a more comprehensive understanding of the Hadith of *al-Thaqalayn* within the context of Islamic scholarly tradition.

Keywords: *Hadith of al-Thaqalayn, Ahlul Bayt, Qur'an, Sunni and Shia, Islamic Leadership.*

ABSTRAK

Hadis *al-Thaqalayn* adalah salah satu hadis penting dalam literatur Islam, terutama dalam tradisi Sunni dan Syiah. Hadis ini menyatakan bahwa Nabi Muhammad (SAW) meninggalkan dua hal yang besar: Al-Qur'an dan Ahlul Bayt. Penelitian ini menganalisis berbagai versi Hadis *al-Thaqalayn* dengan meneliti keaslian, interpretasi, dan implikasinya terhadap kepemimpinan dalam Islam. Dengan membandingkan referensi primer seperti Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim dan Uṣūl al-Kāfī, serta literatur sekunder, penelitian ini menggunakan analisis isi untuk mengidentifikasi variasi redaksi, menganalisis keraguan, dan mengevaluasi kritik ilmiah terhadap hadis *al-Thaqalayn*. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa meskipun terdapat perbedaan dalam penafsiran, tradisi Sunni dan Syiah sama-sama menekankan pentingnya berpegang teguh pada Al-Qur'an dan Sunnah sebagai pedoman utama. Penelitian ini juga menyoroti kompleksitas dalam menilai keandalan hadis, menunjukkan bahwa meskipun beberapa rantai transmisi hadis mungkin dianggap lemah, pesan inti untuk tetap berpegang teguh pada Al-Qur'an dan ajaran Nabi Muhammad tetap penting. Analisis ini juga membahas perdebatan teologis mengenai peran Ahlul Bayt dan memberikan pemahaman yang lebih komprehensif mengenai Hadis *al-Thaqalayn* dalam konteks tradisi keilmuan Islam.

Kata Kunci: *Hadis Al-Thaqalayn; Ahlul Bayt; Al-Qur'an; Sunni dan Syiah; Kepemimpinan Islam.*

A. Introduction

Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* is one of the most discussed traditions in Islamic literature, especially within the contexts of Sunni and Shia Islam.[1] This hadith mentions that Prophet Muhammad (SAW) told his followers that he was leaving behind two weighty things (*thaqalayn*): the Qur'an and the *Ahlul Bayt* (the Prophet's family), assuring them that they would not go astray as long as they held onto both. The significance of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* in the Islamic tradition lies in its assertion that Prophet Muhammad (SAW) left two precious legacies: the Book of Allah (the Qur'an) and his Household (the Prophet's family).[2] This hadith has garnered significant scholarly attention, particularly regarding its authenticity, interpretation, and implications for leadership within Islam through the *sanad* of the hadith.

This research focuses on Hadith *al-Thaqalayn*, which refers to the legacy of Prophet Muhammad, consisting of the Qur'an and *Ahlul Bayt*. This topic is particularly intriguing because the Shia community has a specific interpretation of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn*, wherein *Ahlul Bayt* is considered to play a significant and spiritually authoritative role in Islam.[3] The differences in understanding between Sunni and Shia regarding *Ahlul Bayt* extend beyond *furū'iyyah* (branches of religion) to fundamental principles (*uṣūliyyah*). The primary difference lies in the concept of *imamah*, the belief that 'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib has the right to be the religious and state leader after Prophet Muhammad, surpassing other companions such as Abū Bakr, 'Umar, and 'Uthmān.[4] This divergence creates complex dynamics in intra-religious relationships between the two groups.

The two legacies discussed in Hadith *al-Thaqalayn*, namely the Qur'an and Ahlul Bayt, are widely accepted among both Sunni and Shia circles and are considered mustafīḍah (widely reported) and mutawātir (mass-transmitted).[5] Although this hadith is included in the major sects' books, views on its status often differ. The importance of adhering to the Prophet's (SAW) bequest cannot be denied, with the message of the hadith being clear and easy to understand. However, it is essential to explain the hadith's meaning without imposing a specific viewpoint and to open oneself to objectively reflect on its message, avoiding sectarian fanaticism, so that the Prophet's (SAW) message can be understood and practiced properly.

In Islam, leadership is associated with the terms caliph or Ulil Amri, meaning the highest leader. An ideal leader must be just, trustworthy, intelligent, and professional.[6] Sunni

---

[1] Heki Hartono, 'Menyoal Hadis Tsaqalain Di Indonesia: Tentang Berpegang Teguh Pada Dua Peninggalan Rasulullah', *Islami[Dot]Co*, 2020 <https://islami.co/menyoal-hadis-tsaqalain-di-indonesia-tentang-berpegang-teguh-pada-dua-peninggalan-rasulullah/> [accessed 1 July 2024].

[2] Sanip Nasrullah, 'Authority of History and Sharah Hadith Thaqalayn (Sunnah Itrah)', *Journal of Hadith Studies*, 3.1 (2020), pp. 34–43 (p. 34), doi:10.32506/johs.v3i1.627.

[3] Muhammad Mattori, 'Sikap Syiah Terhadap Sunnah/Hadis Nabi SAW', *Tahdis: Jurnal Kajian Ilmu Al-Hadis*, 13.1 (2022), pp. 54–64 (p. 54), doi:10.24252/tahdis.v13i1.26257; Lenni Lestari, 'Epistemologi Hadis Perspektif Syi'ah', *Al-Bukhari : Jurnal Ilmu Hadis*, 2.1 (2019), pp. 39–52 (p. 39), doi:10.32505/al-bukhari.v2i1.1130.

[4] Rahmat Hamid, Husni Idrus, and Hasaruddin Hasaruddin, 'Sunni and Shia: An Approach From Islamic Thought', *Jurnal Al-Dustur*, 6.1 (2023), pp. 50–71 (p. 50), doi:10.30863/aldustur.v6i1.3777.

[5] Ali Umar Al-Habsyi, *Dua Pusaka Nabi SAW. Al-Qur'an Dan Ahlulbait: Kajian Islam Autentik Pasca Kenabian* (Ilya, 2010), p. 81.

[6] Nurul Hidayah and others, 'Islamic Leadership Concepts and Theories', *FIKROTUNA: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Manajemen Islam*, 16.02 (2023), pp. 306–22 (p. 320), doi:10.32806/jf.v16i02.5708.

and Shia perspectives on leadership reveal significant differences in their views following Prophet Muhammad's death, due to the leadership vacuum left by his failure to designate a successor. Common misconceptions include confusing ushuluddin (fundamental religious beliefs) with *uṣūl al-madhhab* (doctrinal specifics), and incorrectly equating Shia imamah with Sunni caliphate. Imamah, focused on religious guidance, differs from the political aspect of the caliphate.[7] Additionally, Shia belief in imamah does not imply disrespect towards the Prophet's companions or outsiders. Sunni doctrine allows for leadership selection based on capability, not restricted to the ahl Bayt.[8]

The Event of Ghadir Khum, which includes the mention of the al-Thaqalayn hadith, is interpreted differently by Sunni and Shia Muslims. Sunnis see it as a gesture of honor from Prophet Muhammad to 'Ali bin Abi Talib, while Shias view it as a declaration of 'Ali's leadership. The al-Thaqalayn hadith from this event is fundamentally a call to love 'Ali rather than a proclamation of his caliphate.[9] This difference in interpretation highlights the intricate and multifaceted nature of Islamic history and tradition, showing how a single event can be understood in vastly different ways based on religious perspectives.

Supporting and implementing the truth is neither trivial nor easily ignored. Therefore, the mental readiness to face all possible risks is very important. Muslims, both now and in the past, need leaders who can gather various viewpoints and unite the existing sects. The hoped-for unity of the Muslim ummah will not be achieved if there are diverse sects, contradictory opinions, and the emergence of sects influenced by worldly desires. Hadith al-Thaqalayn guides how to achieve the unity of the Muslim ummah. While unity is the goal, some faith aspects allow differing viewpoints, fostering healthy discourse, while others require strict adherence to core principles. Balancing flexibility in interpretation and adherence to fundamental beliefs is key to the Muslim community's strength.

This study is not the first of its kind. Previous research by Hartono (2019)[10] observed how ideology, norms, and hadith science play a role in strengthening the dominance of the discourse on returning to the Qur'an and Sunnah. This article highlights how the power of knowledge shapes, controls, and maintains this idea through social norms, prohibitions,

---

[7] Hesam Babgure, 'The Concept of Leadership in Sunni and Shia Perspectives', *Ampera: A Research Journal on Politics and Islamic Civilization*, 4.01 (2023), pp. 1–10 (p. 9), doi:10.19109/ampera.v4i01.22225; Abdul Manan and Jovial Pally Taran, 'The Sunni-Shia Conflict in the History of Islam: An Analytical Descriptive Study', *Palita: Journal of Social Religion Research*, 5.2 (2020), pp. 165–82 (p. 165), doi:10.24256/pal.v5i2.1327.

[8] Masykuri and others, 'Sunni-Shia Conflict Resolution Strategy And Its Impact On Harmonizing The Society: Evidence From Sampang, Madura', *Al-Qanatir: International Journal of Islamic Studies*, 33.3 (2024), pp. 423–30 (p. 430); Akif Tahiiev, 'Female Leadership in Shia Islam: Women on the Way from Mujtahid to Marja'', *Societies*, 14.1 (2024), p. 2 (p. 8), doi:10.3390/soc14010002.

[9] Bobbi Aidi Rahman, 'The Event of Ghadir Khum: 'Ali Bin Abi Thalib's Leadership in Sunni and Shi'a Perspectives', *El-Afkar: Jurnal Pemikiran Keislaman Dan Tafsir Hadis*, 13.1 (2024), pp. 44–60 (p. 44), doi:10.29300/jpkth.v13i1.3452; Beti Yanuri Posha, 'Penggunaan Hadis Ghadir Khum Sebagai Sumber Sejarah', *Jurnal SAMBAS (Studi Agama, Masyarakat, Budaya, Adat, Sejarah): Journal of Religious, Community, Culture, Costume, History Studies)*, 6.1 (2023), pp. 33–44 (p. 33), doi:10.37567/sambas.v6i1.1905; Nurul Khair, 'Peristiwa Ghadir Khum Dalam Pandangan Teolog Muslim', *Aqlania*, 11.2 (2020), p. 221 (p. 221), doi:10.32678/aqlania.v11i2.2811.

[10] Heki Hartono, 'Relasi Kuasa Dalam Wacana Berpegang Teguh Kepada Dua Pusaka Peninggalan Rasulullah (Hadis Tsaqalain) Di Indonesia', *UNIVERSUM : Jurnal KeIslaman Dan Kebudayaan*, Vol 13, No 1 (2019), 2019.

obligations, and stereotypes. Religious and cultural practices become media for instilling these norms, which function to control public understanding.

Another study by Rizaka et. al (2023)[11] identified Imam al-Kulaynī's interpretation of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* (Two Legacies), highlighting the importance of 'Alī's authority as a companion of the Qur'an to ensure its authenticity. The Shia Imamiyyah restricts Ahlul Bayt to 'Ali, Fāṭimah, Ḥasan, and Ḥusayn, differing from the Sunni view, which is more inclusive.[12] They also believe in distortions in the Qur'an according to the concept of Imamah and their view of the Prophet's companions. This view affects the understanding of the Qur'an, the definition of Ahlul Bayt, and beliefs about the alteration of the sacred text, with significant socio-historical impacts on Muslims.

Another study by Rizaka et. al (2024)[13] also emphasizes that Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* highlights the importance of the Qur'an and Ahlul Bayt as two heavy burdens that Muslims must adhere to. Prophet Muhammad (SAW) underlined that understanding and obeying the Qur'an and following the example of Ahlul Bayt are essential. Ulama's interpretations show the complexity and grandeur of these two sources, emphasizing obedience to the Qur'an and respect for the Prophet's family as the main guide for Muslims to maintain the purity and continuity of Islamic teachings.

Another study by Maghza Rizaka and Muhammad Wahid Hasyim (2024)[14] indicates that the quality of the sanad (chain of narrators) of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* from the narration path of Imam al-Tirmidhī in his Sunan is classified as *dha'īf* (weak) due to narrators involved in *tadlīs* (concealing the identity of their sources) and others considered unreliable. However, after examining the content of the hadith, it becomes clear that Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* aligns with the Qur'an, does not contradict more authoritative hadiths, is based on rational thought, and has a framework that accurately conveys the Prophet's teachings. Thus, the different interpretations of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* affect the historical understanding and intra-community relationships among Muslims.

The researcher's study on Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* provides a comprehensive examination of both sanad (chain of narrators) and matan (content) aspects, distinguishing it from previous research. While Hartono (2019) explored the broader socio-cultural impact of hadith sciences and Rizaka et al. (2023, 2024) focused on Shia interpretations and the significance of Ahlul Bayt, the researcher's work uniquely combines detailed analysis of primary sources like Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim and Uṣūl al-Kāfī with critical examination of secondary literature. Additionally, the researcher addresses the sanad issues highlighted by Maghza

---

[11] Maghza Rizaka, Muhid Muhid, and others, 'Interpretasi Imam Al-Kulaynī Terhadap Hadis Al-Thaqalayni Dalam Pendekatan Sosio-Historis', *TAJDID: Jurnal Ilmu Ushuluddin*, 22.2 (2023), pp. 359–85, doi:10.30631/tjd.v22i2.385.

[12] Dzulkifli Noor, 'Kafa`ah Dalam Pandangan Ahlul Bait', *Emanasi : Jurnal Ilmu Keislaman dan Sosial*, 6.1 (2023), pp. 49–61 (p. 60); Muhid, Moh Imron, and Andris Nurita, 'Ke-'adalah-an Aisyah Perspektif Syiah dan Implikasinya Terhadap Hadis Nabi', *Al-Bukhari : Jurnal Ilmu Hadis*, 6.1 (2023), pp. 66–91 (p. 66), doi:10.32505/al-bukhari.v6i1.5309.

[13] Maghza Rizaka, Ahmad Fauzan Zahri, and others, 'Kajian Asbāb Al-Wurūd Terhadap Hadis Al-Thaqalayn', *KACA (Karunia Cahaya Allah): Jurnal Dialogis Ilmu Ushuluddin*, 14.1 (2024), pp. 107–29, doi:10.36781/kaca.v14i1.587.

[14] Maghza Rizaka and Muhammad Wahid Hasyim, 'A Takhrīj Study of The Hadith Al-Thaqalayn in Sunan Al-Tirmidhī', *Jurnal Indonesia Sosial Teknologi*, 5.4 (2024), pp. 1723–36, doi:10.59141/jist.v5i4.1030.

Rizaka and Muhammad Wahid Hasyim (2024) while also analyzing the hadith's content in relation to Qur'anic teachings. This dual focus allows the study to offer a more nuanced understanding of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn's* authenticity, interpretation, and implications for Islamic leadership within both Sunni and Shia traditions.

From the review of previous studies, the authors offer novelty by directly comparing the wording of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* from *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim* and *Uṣūl al-Kāfī*, highlighting the differences in wording that affect interpretation, and identifying doubts and criticisms from hadith scholars that have not been discussed in previous studies. This research aims to provide a comprehensive understanding with a detailed analysis of the sanad and Matan of the hadith.

This research employs a qualitative approach with a focus on library research.[15] This method relies on primary references from Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim and *Uṣūl al-Kāfī*, which contain the Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* as the main focus of analysis. Additionally, secondary references from various related literature that discuss the context and implications of the hadith are also utilized. Content analysis is used to examine Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* in *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim* and *Uṣūl al-Kāfī*, encompassing the comparison of the text across various sources, identification of differences, analysis of doubts, scholarly critiques, and the development of a comprehensive understanding to provide in-depth insights into this hadith within Sunni and Shia traditions. The data collection process involves several stages, beginning with the gathering of relevant primary and secondary data. Next, the collected data is selected, organized, and focused on relevant aspects through a reduction phase. The final stage involves drawing conclusions, where the deeply analyzed data is used to make accurate and informative conclusions.[16] As this is a library research study, all sources are considered secondary, and the study employs content analysis to thoroughly examine and interpret the collected data.

B. Result and Discussion

1. Identification of the Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn* in Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim and Uṣūl al-Kāfī

To identify where the Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* is mentioned, the author conducted an in-depth search for the words in the hadith text. The first step taken was to examine words that are rarely found in hadith, such as *thaqalayn* (ثقلين) and *'itratī* (عترتي). The author used al-Mu`jam al-Mufahras Li Alfāẓ al-Ḥadīth al-Nabawī as a reference for hadith searches through the method of Takhrīj al-Ḥadīth. In this search, the author found references to these words in Volume 1, page 294 and Volume 4, page 120.[17]

Technically, the author used keywords that allow for the identification of the hadith text through a structured letter index in the book. This process involved detailed and systematic searches to ensure that every occurrence of relevant words was accurately recorded. In other words, the search was meticulously conducted using a categorization approach based on the letter index, which helped the author in identifying and grouping the hadith text based on specific keywords. This method not only broadens the understanding of

---

[15] Michael Bloor and Fiona Wood, *Keyword in Qualitative Methods* (SAGE Publication, 2006), p. 58.
[16] Matthew B. Miles and A. Michael Huberman, *Qualitative Data Analysis*, Second Edition (SAGE Publication, 1994), p. 10.
[17] Arnold John Wensinck, *Al-Mu`jam Al-Mufahras Li Alfāẓ Al-Ḥadith Al-Nabawī*, Jilid 1 (Maktabah Brail, 1936), p. 1:294; Wensinck, p. 4:120.

the dissemination of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* but also provides a more comprehensive picture of the context and locations where the hadith is found.

Table 1. *Takhrīj* Results of Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn* Using *Al-Mu`jam al-Mufahras Li Alfāẓ al-Ḥadīth al-Nabawī*

Hadith Book	Description	Hadith *Takhrīj* Book
Ṣaḥīh Muslim	م فضائل الصحابة 36، 37	المعجم المفهرس لألفاظ
Sunan Al-Tirmidhī	ت مناقب 31	الحديث النبوي

As shown in Table 1, the *takhrīj* of this hadith found references from the six major books (*kutub al-sittah*), namely Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim and Sunan al-Tirmidhī. After the process of tracing primary hadith books, Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* or similar hadith can be found in the following forms:

First, the Ḥadīth of *al-Thaqalayn* from the Muslim narration in the book Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim in Chapter Faḍāil al-Ṣaḥābah Hadith Number 2408,[18] This hadith highlights the importance of the Qur'an and the Prophet's family. It tells Muslims to follow the Qur'an for guidance and to respect the Prophet's family. The text reads:

.......وَأَنَا تَارِكٌ فِيكُمْ ثَقَلَيْنِ؛ أَوَّلُهُمَا كِتَابُ اللهِ، فِيهِ الْهُدَى وَالنُّورُ، فَخُذُوا بِكِتَابِ اللهِ، وَاسْتَمْسِكُوا بِهِ"، فَحَثَّ عَلَى كِتَابِ اللهِ وَرَغَّبَ فِيهِ، ثُمَّ قَالَ: "وَأَهْلُ بَيْتِي، أُذَكِّرُكُمُ اللَّهَ فِي أَهْلِ بَيْتِي، أُذَكِّرُكُمُ اللَّهَ فِي أَهْلِ بَيْتِي، أُذَكِّرُكُمُ اللَّهَ فِي أَهْلِ بَيْتِي".

Secondly, the Ḥadīth of *al-Thaqalayn* from the narration of Muslim in the book Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim in Chapter *Faḍāil al-Ṣaḥābah* Hadith Number 2408,[19] The consistency of this message across different narrators strengthens its authenticity and importance. The text reads:

وَحَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ بَكَّارِ بْنِ الرَّيَّانِ، حَدَّثَنَا حَسَّانُ يَعْنِي ابْنَ إِبْرَاهِيمَ، عَنْ سَعِيدِ بْنِ مَسْرُوقٍ، عَنْ يَزِيدَ بْنِ حَيَّانَ، عَنْ زَيْدِ بْنِ أَرْقَمَ، عَنِ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ - وَسَاقَ الْحَدِيثَ بِنَحْوِهِ بِمَعْنَى حَدِيثِ زُهَيْرٍ.

Third, the Ḥadīth of *al-Thaqalayn* from Muslim's narration in the book Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim in Chapter *Faḍāil al-Ṣaḥābah* Hadith Number 2408,[20] This version emphasizes the consequences of following or not following the Qur'an, reinforcing its importance. The text reads:

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو بَكْرِ بْنُ أَبِي شَيْبَةَ، حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ فُضَيْلٍ. (ح) وَحَدَّثَنَا إِسْحَاقُ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ، أَخْبَرَنَا جَرِيرٌ - كِلَاهُمَا عَنْ أَبِي حَيَّانَ بِهَذَا الْإِسْنَادِ نَحْوَ حَدِيثِ إِسْمَاعِيلَ، وَزَادَ فِي حَدِيثِ جَرِيرٍ : كِتَابُ اللهِ فِيهِ الْهُدَى وَالنُّورُ، مَنِ اسْتَمْسَكَ بِهِ وَأَخَذَ بِهِ كَانَ عَلَى الْهُدَى، وَمَنْ أَخْطَأَهُ ضَلَّ.

[18] Abū Al-Ḥusayn Muslim ibn Al-Hajjāj Al-Qushayrī Al-Naysabūrī, *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, Jilid 7 (Bayt Al-Afkār Al-Dawliyyah, 1998), p. 122.

[19] Al-Naysabūrī, p. 123.

[20] Al-Naysabūrī, p. 123.

Fourth, the Ḥadīth of *al-Thaqalayn* from the Muslim narration in the book of Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim in Chapter Faḍāil al-Ṣaḥābah Hadith Number 2408,[21] This version clarifies who is included in the term "household," highlighting the importance of the Prophet's family beyond his immediate household. The text reads:

حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ بَكَّارِ بْنِ الرَّيَّانِ، حَدَّثَنَا حَسَّانُ يَعْنِي ابْنَ إِبْرَاهِيمَ، عَنْ سَعِيدٍ وَهُوَ ابْنُ مَسْرُوقٍ، عَنْ يَزِيدَ بْنِ حَيَّانَ، عَنْ زَيْدِ بْنِ أَرْقَمَ قَالَ: دَخَلْنَا عَلَيْهِ فَقُلْنَا لَهُ: لَقَدْ رَأَيْتَ خَيْرًا، لَقَدْ صَاحَبْتَ رَسُولَ اللهِ صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَصَلَّيْتَ خَلْفَهُ ـ وَسَاقَ الْحَدِيثَ بِنَحْوِ حَدِيثِ أَبِي حَيَّانَ، غَيْرَ أَنَّهُ قَالَ: أَلَا وَإِنِّي تَارِكٌ فِيكُمْ ثَقَلَيْنِ؛ أَحَدُهُمَا كِتَابُ اللهِ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ، هُوَ حَبْلُ اللهِ، مَنِ اتَّبَعَهُ كَانَ عَلَى الْهُدَى، وَمَنْ تَرَكَهُ كَانَ عَلَى ضَلَالَةٍ وَفِيهِ. فَقُلْنَا: مَنْ أَهْلُ بَيْتِهِ؟ نِسَاؤُهُ؟ قَالَ: لَا، وَايْمُ اللهِ إِنَّ الْمَرْأَةَ تَكُونُ مَعَ الرَّجُلِ الْعَصْرَ مِنَ الدَّهْرِ ثُمَّ يُطَلِّقُهَا فَتَرْجِعُ إِلَى أَبِيهَا وَقَوْمِهَا، أَهْلُ بَيْتِهِ أَصْلُهُ وَعَصَبَتُهُ الَّذِينَ حُرِمُوا الصَّدَقَةَ بَعْدَهُ.

Fifth, the Ḥadīth of *al-Thaqalayn* from the narration of Imam al-Tirmidhi in Sunan al-Tirmidhī, Kitab Al-Manāqib *'An Rasulillah* (PUBH); Chapter 31, Hadith Number 3768,[22] This hadith emphasizes the inseparable roles of the Qur'an and the Prophet's family in guiding Muslims. It describes the Qur'an as a divine connection and stresses the continuous importance of the Ahlul Bayt. The text reads:

حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ الْمُنْذِرِ الْكُوفِيُّ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ فُضَيْلٍ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا الْأَعْمَشُ، عَنْ عَطِيَّةَ، عَنْ أَبِي سَعِيدٍ وَالْأَعْمَشُ، عَنْ حَبِيبِ بْنِ أَبِي ثَابِتٍ، عَنْ زَيْدِ بْنِ أَرْقَمَ قَالَا: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللهِ صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ: إِنِّي تَارِكٌ فِيكُمْ مَا إِنْ تَمَسَّكْتُمْ بِهِ لَنْ تَضِلُّوا بَعْدِي، أَحَدُهُمَا أَعْظَمُ مِنَ الْآخَرِ؛ كِتَابُ اللهِ حَبْلٌ مَمْدُودٌ مِنَ السَّمَاءِ إِلَى الْأَرْضِ، وَعِتْرَتِي أَهْلُ بَيْتِي، وَلَنْ يَتَفَرَّقَا حَتَّى يَرِدَا عَلَيَّ الْحَوْضَ، فَانْظُرُوا كَيْفَ تَخْلُفُونِي فِيهِمَا

The text of the Ḥadīth of *al-Thaqalayn* is attributed to the Prophet (peace be upon him and his progeny) and is narrated in different words in the books of both the Sunni and the Shiite traditions. In the Sunni tradition, the tradition of *al-Thaqalayn* is found in major hadith collections such as *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, and *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, as discussed above. This version of the hadith in Sunni literature often emphasizes the importance of obeying the Qur'ān and following the sunnah of the Prophet. On the other hand, in the Shia tradition, this tradition also plays an important role and is often regarded as one of the bases for legitimizing the authority of the Ahlul Bayt. Shia hadith books, such as *Uṣūl al-Kāfī*,[23] present this tradition in various forms and variants. Imam al-Kulaynī mentions in his book:[24]

---

[21] Al-Naysabūrī, p. 123.

[22] Abū ʿĪsā Muḥammad ibn ʿĪsā Al-Tirmidhī, *Sunan Al-Tirmidhī*, ed. by Bashār ʿAwwād Maʿrūf (Dār al-Gharb al-Islāmī, 1996), p. 125.

[23] Kharis Nugroho, 'Al-Kulaini's Canonization of Al-Kafi', *Tasfiyah: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam*, 6.1 (2022), pp. 115–42 (p. 115), doi:https://doi.org/10.21111/tasfiyah.v6i1.7620.

[24] Muhammad ibn Yaʿqūb Al-Kulaynī, *Uṣūl Al-Kāfī*, Jilid 1, Cetakan Ketiga (Dār al-Kutub al-Islāmiyyah, 1388), p. 294.

... إِنِّي تَارِكٌ فِيكُمْ أَمْرَيْنِ إِنْ أَخَذْتُمْ بِهِمَا لَنْ تَضِلُّوا كِتَابَ اللهِ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ وَأَهْلَ بَيْتِي عِتْرَتِي أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ اسْمَعُوا وَقَدْ بَلَّغْتُ إِنَّكُمْ سَتَرِدُونَ عَلَيَّ الْحَوْضَ فَأَسْأَلُكُمْ عَمَّا فَعَلْتُمْ فِي الثَّقَلَيْنِ وَالثَّقَـلَانِ كِتَابُ اللهِ جَلَّ ذِكْرُهُ وَأَهْلُ بَيْتِي فَلَا تَسْبِقُوهُمْ فَتَهْلِكُوا وَلَا تُعَلِّمُوهُمْ فَإِنَّهُمْ أَعْلَمُ مِنْكُمْ.

The emphasis on the ahl al-bayt in this hadith is one of the hallmarks of the Shia sect. They consider that the true interpretation and understanding of Islam can only be obtained through the Prophet's family, not through the Qur'an alone.

The Hadith of al-Thaqalayn is significant in both Sunni and Shia traditions. It teaches the importance of the Qur'an and the Prophet's family. In Sunni Islam, it emphasizes adherence to the Qur'an and respect for the Ahlul Bayt. In Shia Islam, it supports the belief in the special authority of the Prophet's family.

2. **Differences in the Wording of Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn***
a. **The Wording of Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn* in Sunni Reference Books Mentioning "*Kitābullah Wa 'Itratī*"**

The wording of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* mentioning the *'itrah* (family) of Prophet Muhammad (SAW) without specifically commanding to follow them is mentioned in narrations from companions such as Ali ibn Abi Talib, Abu Sa'id Al-Khudri, Jabir ibn Abdullah, Jubair ibn Mut'im, Hudhaifah ibn Asyad, Zaid ibn Arqam, Zaid ibn Thabit, Abdullah ibn Hantab, and Nubayt ibn Shurayt. However, these will not be discussed in detail to keep the text concise.

In several other hadiths, there is encouragement to adhere to them with phrases like "If you follow them," "If you hold onto them," or "If you adhere to both of them." These hadiths are narrated by Ali ibn Abi Talib, Jabir ibn Abdullah, Abu Sa'id Al-Khudri, Zaid ibn Arqam, and Zaid ibn Thabit.

Table 2. Wording of Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn* in Sunni Reference Books Mentioning "*Kitābullah Wa 'Itratī*"

No.	Companion	The wording of Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn*
1	'Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib	تَرَكْتُ فِيْكُمْ مَا إِنْ أَخَذْتُمْ بِهِ لَنْ تَضِلُّوا: كِتَابَ اللهِ، سَبَبُهُ بِيَدِهِ وَسَبَبُهُ بِأَيْدِيكُمْ، وَأَهْلَ بَيْتِي.
2	Zayd ibn Thābit	إِنِّي تَارِكٌ فِيْكُمْ مَا إِنْ تَمَسَّكْتُمْ بِهِ لَنْ تَضِلُّوا: كِتَابَ اللهِ، وَعِتْرَتِي أَهْلَ بَيْتِي؛ فَإِنَّهُمَا لَنْ يَفْتَرِقَا حَتَّى يَرِدَا عَلَيَّ الْحَوْضَ.
3	Zayd ibn Arqam	إِنِّي تَارِكٌ فِيْكُمْ مَا إِنْ تَمَسَّكْتُمْ بِهِ لَنْ تَضِلُّوا بَعْدِي ـ أَحَدُهُمَا أَعْظَمُ مِنَ الآخَر ـ:كِتَابُ اللهِ، حَبْلٌ مَمْدُودٌ مِنَ السَّمَاءِ إِلَى الأرْضِ، وَعِتْرَتِي أَهْلُ بَيْتِي، وَلَنْ يَتَفَرَّقَا حَتَّى يَرِدَا عَلَيَّ الْحَوْضَ، فَانْظُرُوا كَيْفَ تَخْلُفُونِي فِيْهِمَا.
4	Jābir ibn 'Abdillah	يَا أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ، إِنِّي تَرَكْتُ فِيْكُمْ مَا إِنْ أَخَذْتُمْ بِهِ لَنْ تَضِلُّوا: كِتَابَ اللهِ، وَعِتْرَتِي أَهْلَ بَيْتِي.

5	Abū Saʿīd Al-Khudrī	إِنِّي قَدْ تَرَكْتُ فِيكُمْ مَا إِنْ أَخَذْتُمْ بِهِ، لَنْ تَضِلُّوا بَعْدِي: الثَّقَلَيْنِ – أَحَدُهُمَا أَكْبَرُ مِنَ الآخَرِ ـ كِتَابُ اللهِ، حَبْلٌ مَمْدُوْدٌ مِنَ السَّمَاءِ إِلَى الأَرْضِ، وَعِتْرَتِي أَهْلُ بَيْتِي، أَلَا وَإِنَّهُمَا لَنْ يَفْتَرِقَا حَتَّى يَرِدَا عَلَيَّ الحَوْضَ.

Table 2 above outlines the wording of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* that mentions *'itrah*. Through meticulous analysis of various chains of transmission, insights into the strengths and weaknesses of each *sanad* (chain of narrators) can be found. This examination allows for understanding the context and reliability of each hadith report related to this theme. Each chain of narration has its characteristics affecting its evaluation, whether in terms of the honesty of the narrators or conformity to the scientific principles of hadith, as follows:

First, the hadith through the chain of ʿAlī ibn Abī Ṭālib, narrated by Isḥāq ibn Rāhawayh, includes Kathīr ibn Zayd. Ahmad ibn Hanbal said, "I see no problem with this hadith." Ibn Ma'in said, "There is no problem with him." Abu Zur'ah said, "He is an honest person with minor negligence." Al-Nasa'i said, "He is weak." Abu Ja'far al-Tabari said, "Kathīr ibn Zayd is among those whose hadith cannot be used as evidence." Ibn Hibban said, "He often makes mistakes due to his limited narrations; I do not like using his hadith as evidence if he narrates it alone." Ibn Hajar said, "He is an honest person but often makes mistakes".[25]

Second, the hadith through the chain of Zayd ibn Thābit is weak. It was narrated by Abdu bin Humayd in his Musnad. The chain includes Yahya bin ʿAbd al-Humaid al-Himmani, who was accused of lying and stealing hadith.[26]

Third, the hadith through the chain of Zayd ibn Arqam is mentioned by al-Tirmidhī, who said that this hadith is Ḥasan Gharīb because the chain includes Ali bin al-Mundzir al-Kufi, who al-Nasa'i deemed a pure Shia and trustworthy. Ibn Hajar also considered him an honest narrator but noted his Shia leanings. The chain also includes Muhammad bin Fudail, considered a Shia with Hasan narrations. Yahya bin Ma'in deemed him trustworthy, and Ibn Hibban included him in "al-Thiqāt" but noted his extreme Shia leanings. Abu Dawud said he was a fanatic Shia.[27]

Fourth, the hadith through the chain of Jābir ibn ʿAbdillah is weak. It was narrated by al-Tirmidhī and al-Ṭabrānī. Al-Tirmidhī deemed the hadith Ḥasan Gharīb, while al-Ṭabrānī noted that no one narrated it from Ja'far bin Muhammad except Zaid bin al-Hasan

---

25 Abū Muḥammad ʿAbd al-Rahmān ibn Muḥammad ibn Abī Ḥātim Al-Rāzī, *Al-Jarḥ Wa Al-Taʿdīl* (Dār Iḥyāʾ Al-Turāth Al-ʿArabī, 1952), p. 841.

26 Abū al-Faḍl Aḥmad ibn Ḥajar Al-ʿAsqalānī, *Taqrīb Al-Tahdhīb*, Jilid 1 (Daar al-Rasyid, 1986), p. 7591; Abū al-Faḍl Aḥmad ibn Ḥajar Al-ʿAsqalānī, *Tahdhīb Al-Tahdhīb*, Jilid 1 (Muʾassasah Al-Risalah, 2014), p. 399.

27 Al-ʿAsqalānī, *Taqrīb Al-Tahdhīb*, p. 4803; Al-ʿAsqalānī, *Tahdhīb Al-Tahdhīb*, p. 660; Shams al-Dīn Abū ʿAbdillāh Al-Dhahabī, *Mīzān Al-Iʿtidāl Fī Naqd Al-Rijāl* (Dār Al-Maʿrifah Li Al-Ṭibāʿah Wa Al-Nashr, 1963), p. 7614; Al-Rāzī, p. 1128; Muḥammad ibn Ḥibbān ibn Aḥmad ibn Ḥibbān Al-Tamīmī, *Al-Thiqāt*, Jilid 8 (Dairah Al-Maʿarif Al-Uthmaniyyah, 1973), p. 10505.

al-Anmati. Abu Hatim called him Munkar al-Ḥadīth, and al-Dhahabī said the hadith is ḍaʻīf because Ibn Ḥajar weakened it.[28]

Fifth, the hadith through the chain of Abū Saʻīd Al-Khudrī is weak. It was narrated by Aḥmad, Ibn Abī 'Āṣim, Abū Ya'lā, al-Ṭabrānī, and al-Baghawī. The chain includes 'Aṭiyyah al-'Awfī, who was deemed weak by Aḥmad and Abu Hatim Ar-Razi. Ibn Ḥibbān also weakened him, stating, "It is not permissible to use his hadith as evidence, and his hadith should only be written out of wonder." Ibn Ḥajar said he was a trustworthy narrator but often made mistakes and was a covert Shia.[29]

Overall, the analysis of various chains of transmission of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* mentioning *'itrah* highlights the complexity of evaluating the reliability of these hadiths. Although some chains may be considered weak or questionable, there are still valuable elements within these hadiths for further study. With a deeper understanding of the historical context, narrator methodology, and hadith reliability assessment, better insights can be gained into the meaning and relevance of these reports within Islamic scholarly tradition.

After examining various chains of transmission for the hadiths related to Hadith al-Thaqalayn, researcher typically finds that the credibility of these hadiths is nuanced and complex. For instance, some chains are deemed weak due to unreliable narrators or inconsistencies, as seen in the criticisms of narrators like Kathīr ibn Zayd and Yahya bin 'Abd al-Humayd al-Himmani. Others are considered to have some level of reliability but are marked by controversial aspects, such as the Shia leanings of certain narrators, which affects their acceptance among different scholars. Despite these variations, scholars acknowledge the importance of these hadiths for further investigation and understanding, as they offer valuable insights into the broader context of Islamic tradition, provided that researcher carefully assess the historical and methodological factors influencing the evaluation of each hadith.

b. The Wording of Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn* in Sunni Reference Books Mentioning "*Kitābullah Wa Sunnatī*"

The segments of hadith encouraging adherence to the Book of Allah and the Sunnah of His Prophet (SAW) have been narrated by several companions, including:

Table 3. Wording of Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn* in Sunni Reference Books Mentioning "*Kitābullah Wa Sunnatī*"

No.	Companion	Wording of Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn*
1	'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb	تَرَكْتُ فِيْكُمْ أَمْرَيْنِ لَنْ تَضِلُّوا بَعْدَهُمَا: كِتَابَ اللهِ جَلَّ وَعَزَّ، وَسُنَّةَ نَبِيّهِ صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ.
2	'Abdullah ibn 'Umar	... وَمَا عَطَّلُوا كِتَابَ اللهِ وَسُنَّةَ رَسُوْلِهِ، إِلَّا جَعَلَ اللهُ بَأْسَهُمْ بَيْنَهُمْ.

---

[28] Al-'Asqalānī, *Taqrīb Al-Tahdhīb*, p. 2127; Shams al-Dīn Abū 'Abdillāh Al-Dhahabī, *Al-Kāshif Fi Ma'rifati Man Lahu Riwāyah Fi al-Kutub al-Sittah*, Jilid 1 (Daar al-Qiblah Li al-Thaqafah al-Islamiyyah – Mu'assasah 'Ulum Al-Quran, 1992), p. 1731; Al-Rāzī, p. 2533.

[29] Al-'Asqalānī, *Taqrīb Al-Tahdhīb*, p. 4616; Al-Rāzī, p. 383; Muḥammad Ibn Ḥibbān Ibn Aḥmad Ibn Ḥibbān Al-Sijistānī, *Al-Majrūḥīn Min Al-Muḥaddithīn* (Dār Al-Ṣamī'ī, 2000), p. 176.

3	‘Abdullah ibn ‘Abbās	تَرَكْتُ فِيْكُمْ أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ، مَا إِنِ اعْتَصَمْتُمْ بِهِ، فَلَنْ تَضِلُّوا أَبَدًا: كِتَابَ اللهِ، وَسُنَّةَ نَبِيِّهِ.
4	Anas ibn Mālik	قَدْ تَرَكْتُ فِيْكُمْ بَعْدِي مَا إِنْ أَخَذْتُمْ، لَمْ تَضِلُّوا: كِتَابَ اللهِ، وَسُنَّةَ نَبِيِّكُمْ صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ.
5	Abū Hurayrah	إِنِّي قَدْ خَلَّفْتُ فِيْكُمُ اثْنَيْنِ، لَنْ تَضِلُّوا بَعْدَهُمَا أَبَدًا: كِتَابَ اللهِ، وَسُنَّتِي، وَلَنْ يَتَفَرَّقَا حَتَّى يَرِدَا عَلَيَّ الْحَوْضَ.
6	Abū Sa‘īd al-Khudrī	يَا أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ, إِنِّي قَدْ تَرَكْتُ فِيْكُمُ الثَّقَلَيْنِ: كِتَابَ اللهِ، وَسُنَّتِي؛ فَاسْتَنْطِقُوا الْقُرْآنَ بِسُنَّتِي, وَلَا تَعْسِفُوهُ؛ فَإِنَّهُ لَنْ تَعْمَى أَبْصَارُكُمْ , وَلَنْ تَزِلَّ أَقْدَامُكُمْ، وَلَنْ تَقْصُرَ أَيْدِيكُمْ مَا أَخَذْتُمْ بِهِمَا.
7	‘Urwah ibn al-Zubayr	تَرَكْتُ فِيْكُمْ مَا إِنِ اعْتَصَمْتُمْ بِهِ، لَنْ تَضِلُّوا أَبَدًا: أَمْرَيْنِ بَيِّنَيْنِ: كِتَابَ اللهِ، وَسُنَّةَ نَبِيِّكُمْ
8	‘Abdullah ibn Abī Najīḥ	تَرَكْتُ فِيْكُمْ مَا إِنِ اعْتَصَمْتُمْ بِهِ، فَلَنْ تَضِلُّوا أَبَدًا: كِتَابَ اللهِ، وَسُنَّةَ نَبِيِّهِ.
9	‘Amr ibn ‘Awf al-Muzanī	تَرَكْتُ فِيْكُمْ أَمْرَيْنِ، لَنْ تَضِلُّوا مَا تَمَسَّكْتُمْ بِهِمَا: كِتَابَ اللهِ، وَسُنَّةَ نَبِيِّهِ.
10	Mūsā ibn ‘Uqbah	... لَنْ تَضِلُّوا بَعْدَهُ أَبَدًا، أَمْرًا بَيِّنًا: كِتَابَ اللهِ، وَسُنَّةَ نَبِيِّهِ.
11	Nājiyah ibn Jundub	تَرَكْتُ فِيْكُمْ مَا إِنْ أَخَذْتُمْ بِهِ، لَمْ تَضِلُّوا: كِتَابَ اللهِ، وَسُنَّتَهُ بِأَيْدِيْكُمْ! وَيُقَالُ: قَدْ تَرَكْتُ فِيْكُمْ: كِتَابَ اللهِ، وَسُنَّةَ نَبِيِّهِ.

Table 3 above summarizes various narrations of Hadith a*l-Thaqalayn* mentioning the word sunnah instead of *'itrah*. Through various chains of transmission, these hadiths demonstrate the complexity of tracing and evaluating the authenticity of the sanad (chain of narrators). Among these narrations, there is variation in the strength of the sanad, ranging from weak to strong, providing an overview of the diversity of interpretations and evaluations among hadith scholars, as follows:

First, the hadith through the chain of ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb is narrated by Baḥshal with a weak chain due to the presence of an unknown narrator (*majhūl*).[30]

Second, the hadith through the chain of ‘Abdullah ibn ‘Umar is narrated by al-Bayhaqī and weakened by both him and al-Sakhāwī but deemed ṣaḥīḥ by al-Albānī.[31]

---

[30] Aslam Ibn Sahl Ibn Al-Razāz Al-Wāsiṭī Baḥshal, *Tārīkh Wāsiṭ* (‘Ālam Al-Kutub, 1986), p. 50.

[31] Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn al-Ḥusayn Al-Bayhaqī, *Shu‘ab al-Īmān*, Jilid 4 (Maktabah Al-Rushd, 2003), p. 3315; Syams al-Dīn Muḥammad ibn ’Abd al-Raḥmān Al-Sakhāwī, *Al-Ajwibah al-Marḍiyyah Fīmā Su’ila al-Sakhāwī ‘Anhu Min al-Aḥādīth al-Nabawiyyah*, Jilid 2, Cetakan Pertama (Daar Al-Rayah Li Al-Nasyr wa Al-Tawzi’, 1418), p. 546.

Third, the hadith through the chain of 'Abdullah ibn 'Abbās is narrated by al-Ḥākim, al-Marwazī, al-'Uqaylī, and al-Bayhaqī with a *ṣaḥīḥ* chain.[32]

Fourth, the hadith through the chain of Anas ibn Mālik is narrated by Abu Nu'aim with a weak chain due to the presence of Yazīd al-Raqāshī. Al-Bukhari said, "Shu'bah criticized him." Abū Dāwud conveyed from Aḥmad, "Yazīd's hadith should not be written." Ibn Ma'īn said, "He is a righteous person, but his hadith is not valuable." Abū Ḥātim said, "There is weakness in his hadith." Al-Nasā'ī and al-Ḥākim Abū Aḥmad said, "His hadith is abandoned." Ibn Adī said, "He has good hadiths from Anas and others, and I hope there is no problem with him because trustworthy narrators have narrated from him".[33]

Fifth, the hadith through the chain of Abū Hurayrah is narrated by al-Bazzār, al-'Uqaylī, Ibn 'Addī, and al-Dāruquṭnī. The chain is weak due to the presence of Ṣāliḥ al-Ṭalḥī.[34]

Sixth, the hadith through the chain of Abū Sa'īd al-Khudrī is narrated by al-Khaṭīb with a weak chain due to the presence of Sayf ibn 'Umar, who was weakened by Ibn Ma'īn. Abū Ḥātim said that his hadith is abandoned and similar to al-Wāqidī's hadith, which is also weak. Abū Dāwud gave a very negative assessment, stating that his hadith is worthless. Additionally, al-Nasā'ī and al-Dāraquṭnī agreed that this narrator is weak.[35] It also includes Abān ibn Isḥāq al-Asadī and al-Ṣabbāḥ ibn Muḥammad, both of whom are doubtful.[36]

Seventh, the hadith through the chain of 'Urwah ibn al-Zubayr is narrated by al-Bayhaqī with a weak chain due to the presence of 'Abdullah ibn Lahay'ah, who was deemed weak.[37]

Eighth, the hadith through the chain of 'Abdullah ibn Abī Najīḥ is narrated by al-Ṭabarī with a chain entirely composed of trustworthy narrators except for Muḥammad ibn Ḥumayd al-Rāzī.[38]

Ninth, the hadith through the chain of 'Amr ibn 'Awf al-Muzanī is narrated by Ibn 'Abd al-Barr and al-Shajarī, both of whom considered the chain very weak due to the presence of Isḥāq ibn Ibrāhīm al-Ḥunaynī and Kathīr ibn 'Abdillah ibn 'Amr ibn 'Awf, both of whom are weak.[39]

Tenth, the hadith through the chain of Mūsā ibn 'Uqbah is narrated by al-Bayhaqī, and it includes Ibn Abī Uways. Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal opined that there was no problem with him, indicating a positive acceptance. However, Yahyā ibn Ma'īn provided a more critical view, saying that although Ibn Abi Uways was honest, he had weaknesses in intelligence

---

[32] Abū Ja'far Muḥammad Ibn 'Amr Ibn Mūsā Ibn Ḥammād Al-'Uqaylī, *Kitāb Al-Ḍu'afā' Al-Kabīr* (Dār Al-Kutub Al-'Ilmiyyah, 1984), p. 250.

[33] Al-'Asqalānī, *Tahdhīb Al-Tahdhīb*, p. 271.

[34] 'Alī Ibn Aḥmad Ibn Sa'īd Ibn Ḥazm Al-Andalusī, *Al-Iḥkām Fī Uṣūl Al-Aḥkām* (Dār Al-Āfāq Al-Jadīdah, 1983), p. 251.

[35] Al-'Asqalānī, *Tahdhīb Al-Tahdhīb*, p. 259.

[36] Al-'Asqalānī, *Tahdhīb Al-Tahdhīb*, p. 275.

[37] Al-'Asqalānī, *Taqrīb Al-Tahdhīb*, p. 3563; Al-Dhahabī, *Al-Kāshif Fi Ma'rifati Man Lahu Riwāyah Fi al-Kutub al-Sittah*, p. 2934; Al-Rāzī, p. 147; Al-Sijistānī, p. 431.

[38] Abū Ja'far Muḥammad Ibn Jarīr Al-Ṭabarī, *Tārīkh Al-Rusul Wa Al-Muluk*, ed. by Muḥammad Abū Al-Faḍl Ibrāhīm (Dār Al-Ma'ārif, 1967), p. 181.

[39] Al-'Asqalānī, *Tahdhīb Al-Tahdhīb*, p. 194,377.

and was not very strong. Abū Ḥātim al-Rāzi added that although Ibn Abi Uways was considered honest, he was also known to be careless.[40]

Eleventh, the hadith through the chain of Nājiyah ibn Jundub is narrated by al-Wāqidī, whose hadith is *matrūk* (abandoned).[41]

In tracing the narrations of Hadith a*l-Thaqalayn*, researcher found various understandings and evaluations of the strength of the sanad.[42] Although some narrations are deemed weak due to untrustworthy narrators or unclear transmission chains, there are also narrations considered strong and authentic. This study underscores the importance of a critical approach in tracing hadith and the need to consider various historical and methodological factors in evaluating the authenticity of a narration. Therefore, the above tables not only serve as a source of information but also as an entry point for deep reflection on the diversity and complexity within the tradition of Islamic hadith studies.

c. The Wording of Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn* in Shia Reference Books Mentioning "*Kitābullah Wa Sunnatī*"

In Shia tradition, the emphasis on the term "*Itratī*" or *Ahlul Bayt* in Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* is a distinctive feature. Shia Muslims believe that the true interpretation and understanding of Islamic teachings can only be obtained through the Prophet's family, placing them in a central position in religious heritage. However, there is debate about the extent to which this emphasis may overlook the importance of the Qur'an and the Sunnah of the Prophet as primary guides for Muslims. Some Shia adherents may not fully recognize that their primary texts also emphasize adherence to the Qur'an and the Sunnah of the Prophet Muhammad (SAW). This indicates that while the emphasis on *Ahlul Bayt* plays a crucial role in Shia identity and teachings, it is also important to acknowledge that their primary texts stress the significance of adhering to the Qur'an and the Sunnah of the Prophet, as illustrated in the table below:

Table 4. The wording of Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn* in Shia Reference Books Mentioning *"Kitābullah Wa Sunnatī"*

No.	Wording of Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn*
1	عَنْ أَبِي جَعْفَرٍ عَنْ رَسُوْلِ اللهِ أَنَّهُ قَالَ: فَإِذَا أَتَاكُمُ الْحَدِيْثُ عَنِّي فَأَعْرِضُوْهُ عَلَى كِتَابِ اللهِ وَسُنَّتِي، فَمَا وَافَقَ كِتَابَ اللهِ وَسُنَّتِي فَخُذُوا بِهِ، وَمَا خَالَفَ كِتَابَ اللهِ وَسُنَّتِي فَلَا تَأْخُذُوا بِهِ.
2	عَنْ أَبِي جَعْفَرٍ أَنَّ رَسُوْلَ اللهِ صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ: إِنِّي مَسْئُوْلٌ عَنْ تَبْلِيْغِ هَذِهِ الرِّسَالَةِ وَأَمَّا أَنْتُمْ فَتُسْأَلُوْنَ عَمَّا حُمِلْتُمْ مِنْ كِتَابِ اللهِ وَسُنَّتِي.
3	عَنْ عَلِيٍّ أَنَّهُ قَالَ: عَلَيْنَا العَمَلُ بِكِتَابِ اللهِ وَسِيْرَةِ رَسُوْلِهِ، وَالنَّعْشِ لِسُنَّتِهِ.

---

  [40] Al-Rāzī, p. 613.

  [41] Al-ʿAsqalānī, *Tahdhīb Al-Tahdhīb*, p. 323.

  [42] Ahmad Kamaluddin, 'Naqd As-Sanad : Metodologi Validasi Hadits Shahih', *MUSHAF JOURNAL: Jurnal Ilmu Al Quran Dan Hadis*, 3.2 (2023), pp. 229–39 (p. 229), doi:10.54443/mushaf.v3i2.136; Ahmad Salahuddin M. Azizan, Zulhilmi Mohamed Nor, and Muhammad Akmalludin Mohd Hamdan, 'Metodologi Kritikan Sanad Riwayat Sirah: Satu Kajian Terhadap Akram Ḍiyāʾ Al-ʿumarī Dalam Karyanya Al-Sīrah Al-Nabawiyyah Al-Ṣaḥīḥah', *Journal Of Hadith Studies*, 2024, pp. 81–89 (p. 81), doi:10.33102/johs.v9i1.289.

4	عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللهِ أَنَّهُ قَالَ: مَنْ خَالَفَ كِتَابَ اللهِ وَسُنَّةَ مُحَمَّدٍ فَقَدْ كَفَرَ.
5	عَنْ عَبْدِ اللهِ بْنِ أَوْفَى قَوْلَهُ: آخَى رَسُوْلُ اللهِ صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ بَيْنَ أَصْحَابِهِ وَتَرَكَ عَلِيًّا فَقَالَ لَهُ: آخَيْتَ بَيْنَ أَصْحَابِكَ وَتَرَكْتَنِي؟ فَقَالَ: وَالَّذِي نَفْسِي بِيَدِهِ مَا أَبْقَيْتُكَ إِلَّا لِنَفْسِي، أَنْتَ أَخِي وَوَصِيِّي وَوَارِثِي. قَالَ: وَمَا أَرِثُ مِنْكَ يَا رَسُوْلَ اللهِ؟ قَالَ: مَا أَوْرَثَ النَّبِيُّوْنَ قَبْلِي: كِتَابُ رِبِّهِمْ وَسُنَّةُ نَبِيِّهِمْ.

Table 4 above outlines several narrations in Shia literature that emphasize the importance of following the Qur'an and the Sunnah of the Prophet. For example, the narration from Abū Ja'far mentions that the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) said, "If a hadith comes to you from me, compare it with the Book of Allah and my Sunnah. What agrees with the Book of Allah and my Sunnah, take it, and what contradicts the Book of Allah and my Sunnah, do not take it." This narration can be found in books such as *Al-Iḥtijāj* by Al-Ṭabrisī, *Bihār al-Anwār* by Al-Majlisī, and *Al-Ṣirāṭ* al-Mustaqīm by *Al-Bayāḍī*.[43]

One hadith in Kitab Al-Kāfī mentions that the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) is responsible for delivering the message, and the people will be questioned about what they received from the Qur'an and the Sunnah of the Prophet. The hadith reads: "I am responsible for delivering this message, and you will be questioned about what you received from the Qur'an and my Sunnah".[44] This hadith underscores that the Prophet has conveyed Allah's revelation completely and accurately to humanity. Therefore, Muslims have the responsibility to understand, practice, and uphold the teachings contained in the Qur'an and the Sunnah.

Al-Ḥillī, a prominent Shia scholar from the 13th century, in his work *Al-Mukhtasar al-Nafi'*, asserts that in both Shia and Sunni traditions, the Sunnah is considered the second source after the Qur'an in Islamic law.[45] This statement indicates a consensus between Sunni and Shia regarding the role of the Sunnah as a source of law and teaching. Despite various theological, jurisprudential, and ritual differences between Shia and Sunni, the shared recognition of the Sunnah as a source of law demonstrates unity in the fundamental teachings of Islam. This underscores the importance of the Sunnah in maintaining the coherence and integrity of Islamic teachings as a whole.

With these references, it is clear that primary Shia literature also emphasizes the importance of adhering to the Qur'an and the Sunnah of the Prophet. This shows that the teaching to adhere to the Qur'an and the Sunnah is not only found in Sunni tradition but is also respected and recommended in Shia tradition. The common respect for the Sunnah indicates a significant point of convergence between the two main branches of Islam concerning the sources of teachings and laws.

---

[43] 'Alī Ibn Yūnus Al-'Āmilī Al-Nabāṭī Al-Bayāḍī, *Al-Ṣirāṭ al-Mustaqīm Ilā Mustaḥiqqī Al-Taqdīm* (Maṭba'at Al-Ḥaydarī), III, p. 156; Muḥammad Bāqir Al-Majlisī, *Bihar Al-Anwar* (Mu'assasat al-Wafā', 1983), II, p. 225; Abū Mansūr Aḥmad Ibn 'Alī Ibn Abī Ṭālib Al-Ṭabrisī, *Al-Ihtijaj 'Alā Ahl Al-Lajāj* (Maṭabi' Al-Nu'mān, 1966), II, p. 246.

[44] Al-Kulaynī, p. 606.

[45] Abū Al-Qāsim Najm Al-Dīn Ja'fār Ibn Al-Ḥasan Al-Ḥillī, *Al-Mukhtaṣar Al-Nāfi' Fī Fiqh Al-Imāmiyyah*, Cetakan Ketiga (Mu'assat Al-Bi'thah, 1410), p. 17.

Fundamentally, Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* is one of the important hadiths in Islam, widely discussed by both major branches, Sunni and Shia. This hadith refers to the statement of Prophet Muhammad (SAW) mentioning that he left behind two weighty things (*thaqalayn*) that will be a guide for his ummah after him: the Qur'an and his *Ahlul Bayt*. The difference in emphasis on the words *'itratī* and *sunnatī* largely relates to the interpretation and emphasis given by each branch to this hadith.

In the examination of Sunni hadith books, Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* also mentions the word *'itratī*, although there is more emphasis on the word *sunnatī*, which is more popularized by Sunni scholars. This does not necessarily mean that the term *'itratī* is completely unacknowledged in Sunni circles, but rather that there is greater emphasis and popularization on the term *sunnatī*. The reasons behind this different emphasis can include ideological, historical, and theological perspectives that have developed within each branch, including concerns about the association of the term 'itratī with Shia doctrine.

Meanwhile, in the examination of Shia hadith books, Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* also mentions the word *sunnatī*, although there is more emphasis on the word *'itratī*, which is more popularized by Shia scholars. This does not necessarily mean that the term *sunnatī* is completely unacknowledged in Shia circles, but rather that there is greater emphasis and popularization on the term *'itratī* because it strengthens their recognition of the authority of the Prophet's *Ahlul Bayt* as a legitimate leader after him.

It is known that the hadith *al-Thaqalayn* with the wording "*Kitabullah wa Sunnatī*" does not have a reliable source, as such hadith is not found in any *Ṣaḥīḥ* or *Musnad* hadith books. These hadiths are considered fabricated, especially those narrating that the Prophet (SAW) said it during his Farewell Pilgrimage. It is believed that these hadiths were fabricated for certain purposes, including to compete with the Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* with the wording "*wa 'itratī*," which is widely accepted as authentic by Muslims, proven true from the Prophet (SAW), and conveyed on various occasions, including during his Farewell Pilgrimage.

Even if it is considered ṣaḥīḥ by some, it does not contradict the hadith "wa 'itratī," as no Muslim or Islamic sect doubts the necessity of adhering to the Sunnah of the Prophet (SAW). However, the hadith "*wa 'itratī*" contains the message that "Sunnah" must be taken from the pure lineage (*'itrah*) who are guaranteed to be righteous, not from just anyone, even if they are known as hypocrites or liars, as they are the holy personalities and leaders of the ummah. This understanding is also upheld by hadith scholars and commentators of their books. Therefore, scholars like al-Muttaqī al-Hindī mention both groups of hadith in one section explaining the necessity of adhering to the Qur'an and the Sunnah. Similarly, Ibn Ḥajar, as previously discussed, holds the same view.

3. **Doubts Regarding Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn* in Interpretations of Ahlul Bayt**

There are doubts expressed by some Shia scholars and those influenced by them about the hadith emphasizing the importance of adhering to the *Ahlul Bayt* of Prophet Muhammad (SAW). These doubts arise from the belief that the hadith is weak, and thus cannot be used as a reference for Islamic jurisprudence. However, several points can be made in response to these doubts:

First, the presence of the hadith in *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*: The hadith commanding adherence to the *Ahlul Bayt* and following them is found in Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim. The inclusion of this hadith in a collection considered authentic (*ṣaḥīḥ*) lends strength and credibility to its authenticity.

Second, the weakness of the questioned chains of transmission (sanad): The chains of transmission that cast doubt on the authenticity of the hadith are generally weak and unreliable in the context of Islamic jurisprudence and law. Therefore, opinions that doubt the hadith cannot be based on these questionable chains of transmission.

Third, referring to the consensus of the Muslim community: In addition to the presence of the hadith in *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, the command to adhere to the *Ahlul Bayt* and follow them aligns with the consensus of the Muslim community regarding the importance of the *Ahlul Bayt*. This consensus reinforces the significance of the hadith in the religious practice of Muslims.

Thus, it can be said that the hadith commanding adherence to the *Ahlul Bayt* and following them, as found in *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, is *ṣaḥīḥ* (authentic), and Muslims are encouraged to take guidance from this hadith in their understanding and religious practices while remaining mindful of the distinctions between ṣaḥīḥ hadiths and those whose authenticity is in question.[46]

In response to the aforementioned doubts, it can be clarified that in Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim, the explicit command to follow the *Ahlul Bayt* of Prophet Muhammad (SAW) is not mentioned. What is mentioned is the command to take the Book of Allah as the primary guide, followed by a reminder to honor and respect the *Ahlul Bayt*. This is reflected in the hadith of *Hajjatul Wada'* (The Farewell Pilgrimage), where Prophet Muhammad (SAW) emphasized the importance of following the Book of Allah and then mentioned the *Ahlul Bayt* as complementary, not as a replacement or primary focus. This is supported by scholars such as Abu al-Abbas al-Qurtubi and Ibn Kathir, who emphasized the importance of respecting and loving the *Ahlul Bayt* while maintaining that the Book of Allah remains the primary source of guidance.[47] Contemporary scholars like Ibn Bāz also affirm that Muslims are commanded to love the *Ahlul Bayt* who adhere to Allah's laws, but the command to follow them is not as strong as the command to follow the Book of Allah. In the hadith explained by Ibn Bāz, the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) mentioned the Book of Allah first, then the *Ahlul Bayt*, highlighting that following the *Ahlul Bayt* is more a reminder of their importance and respect rather than an exclusive directive.[48]

In the Hadith *al-Thaqalayn*, Prophet Muhammad (SAW) mentions "*Ahl al-Baytī*," which includes all his descendants from the tribe of Bani Hashim, such as Ibn Abbas, Ibn

---

[46] Althaf Husein Muzakky and Agung Syaikhul Mukarrom, 'Studi Hadis Menghormati Ahlulbait: Dari Pemahaman Tekstualis Sampai Kontekstualis', *Riwayah: Jurnal Studi Hadis*, 7.1 (2021), pp. 67–88 (p. 84), doi:10.21043/riwayah.v7i1.8999.

[47] Abū al-Fidā' Ismā'īl ibn 'Umar ibn Kathīr Al-Qurashī, *Tafsīr Al-Qur'ān al-'Aẓīm*, ed. by Muḥammad Ḥusayn Syams Al-Dīn (Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 2004), VII, p. 201; Aḥmad ibn 'Umar ibn Ibrāhīm Al-Qurṭubī, *Al-Mufhim Limā Ashkala Min Kitāb Talkhīṣ Muslim* (Dār Ibn Kathīr, 1996), XX, p. 51.

[48] 'Abd al-'Azīz Ibn Bāz 'Abdullah Ibn Bāz, *Majmū' Fatāwā Wa Maqālāt Mutanawwi'ah*, ed. by Muḥammad ibn Sa'd Al-Shuway'ir (Dār al-Qāsim Li al-Nashr, 1420), III, p. 37.

Al-Abbas, Ibn Al-Harith bin Abdul Muttalib, and other descendants from Bani Hashim.[49] This does not only refer to ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib and his two sons, Ḥasan and Husayn, as asserted by the Twelver Shia. This clearly shows that *Ahlul Bayt* is not limited to Ali and his descendants alone but also includes other family members and even the wives of the Prophet. Therefore, the conclusion that the command to follow the *Ahlul Bayt* refers exclusively to ‘Alī and his descendants is not strongly supported by evidence.

The question of who is meant by "*Ahlul Bayt*" in the hadith is a continuing debate.[50] Whether it only refers to those who directly lived with the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) and narrated hadith from him, such as ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib, Ḥasan, and Ḥusayn, or whether it also includes their descendants and others who might not agree with the teachings they inherited. However, the clear understanding of this hadith is that *Ahlul Bayt* are those who follow the Sunnah of Prophet Muhammad (SAW) with adherence to the Book of Allah. Following the Sunnah of Prophet Muhammad (SAW) also includes following the example of the Rightly Guided Caliphs, as affirmed in hadiths mentioning Abu Bakr and Umar.[51] This indicates that the importance of following the Sunnah is not limited to the *Ahlul Bayt* but also includes the companions of the Prophet, who are an integral part of Islamic heritage.

If there is a conflict between the teachings of the *Ahlul Bayt* and the Book of Allah, priority must be given to the Book of Allah. In Islam, the Book of Allah is the primary authoritative source and any teaching or interpretation that contradicts the Qur'an must be rejected. Therefore, if *Ahlul Bayt*'s teachings conflict with the teachings of the Book of Allah, it is the Book of Allah that must be followed. This demonstrates that the connection of the *Ahlul Bayt* with the Sunnah of Prophet Muhammad (SAW) is through adherence to the teachings of the Qur'an and the Sunnah, which must be based on the Book of Allah.

4. Scholarly Critiques of Hadith *Al-Thaqalayn*

Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* is one of the most frequently discussed hadiths in theological debates between Sunni and Shia. The text of this hadith mentions that the Prophet Muhammad (SAW) left behind two "*thaqal*" (valuable things) among his ummah, and if they adhere to both, they will not go astray. The debate centers on the interpretation of what these two "*thaqal*" are. Here are various scholarly perspectives on the meaning of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn*.

Imam al-Bukhārī, in his book Tārīkh Ṣaghīr, rejects the authenticity of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* by stating: "Ahmad said about the hadith of ‘Abdul Malik from ‘Aṭiyyah from Abu Sa’id that the Prophet (SAW) said: ‘I leave among you *thaqalayn*’ – these hadiths of

---

[49] Abū Al-‘Abbās Taqiyy Al-Dīn Ibn Taymiyyah Al-Dimashqī Al-Ḥanbalī, *Minhāj Al-Sunnah Al-Nabawiyyah Fī Naqḍ Kalām Al-Shī‘ah Al-Qadariyyah*, ed. by Muḥammad Rashād Sālim (Jāmi‘at Al-Imām Muḥammad Ibn Sa‘ūd Al-Islāmiyyah, 1986), VII, p. 395.

[50] Gumilar Irfanullah, Dewi Anggraeni, and Ina Agustina, ‘Ahlul Bait Dalam Puisi-Puisi Penyair Keturunan Bani Umayyah: Studi Historis dan Kritik Sastra Atas Karya Abu Adiy al-Umawi, Marwan as-Saruji dan Al-Abiwardi’, *Jurnal Tamaddun*, 11.2 (2023), p. 163, doi:10.24235/tamaddun.v11i2.15218; Asep Achmad Hidayat and others, ‘Ahlul Bait’s First Arrival in Indonesia and The Exploration of Islamic History in Southeast Asia’, *Al-Tsaqafa : Jurnal Ilmiah Peradaban Islam*, 20.2 (2023), pp. 172–93 (p. 172), doi:10.15575/al-tsaqafa.v20i2.29802.

[51] Muhammad Hasan Rifqi and Ahmad Masyhur, ‘The Legality of the Leadership of Abu Bakr, Umar, and Usman: The Ismaili and Zaidiyah Shia Perspectives’, *Scientia*, 2.1 (2023), pp. 387–92 (p. 387), doi:10.51773/sssh.v2i1.181.

the people of Kufa are *Munkar* (denounced)." Additionally, in his book al-'Ilal al-Mutanāhiyah,[52] he states: "The hadith about the will to adhere to his *'itrah*: 'Abdul Wahhab al-Anmanthi informed us, saying: Muhammad ibn Mudzaffar informed us, saying: Ahmad ibn Muhammad al-'Aqiqi informed us, saying: Yusuf ibn Dakhil spoke to us, saying: Abu Ja'far al-'Uqaylī spoke to us, saying: Ahmad ibn Yaḥyā al-Halwani informed us, saying: 'Abdullāh ibn Dahir informed us, saying: 'Abdullāh ibn Quddus informed us from A'masy from 'Aṭiyyah from Abu Sa'id al-Khudri, who said that the Prophet (SAW) said:

إِنِّي تَارِكٌ فِيْكُمُ الثَّقَلَيْنِ كِتَابَ اللهِ وَعِتْرَتِي إِنَّهُمَا لَنْ يَفْتَرِقَا جَمِيْعًا حَتَّى يَرِدَا عَلَيَّ الْحَوْضَ فَانْظُرُوا كَيْفَ تَخْلُفُونِي فِيْهِمَا

Indeed, I leave among you thaqalayn: the Book of Allah and my 'itrah (family), and indeed, they will not separate until they meet me at the pond (hawḍ), so consider how you treat them after me.

He asserts that this hadith is not *ṣaḥīḥ* (authentic). 'Aṭiyyah has been weakened by Ahmad and Yaḥyā ibn Ma'īn, among others. Furthermore, Ibn 'Abd al-Quddūs is described by Yaḥyā as having no value, a notorious *rāfiḍah* (a term often used pejoratively for Shia). As for 'Abdullah ibn Ẓāhir, Aḥmad, and Yaḥyā stated that he is worthless, and no one of good character would write hadiths from him.

Imam Muslim, who also narrates Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* in his *Ṣaḥīḥ*, lends credence to its authenticity. Scholars agree that questioning the authenticity of this hadith would be an open contradiction to the sayings of the Prophet (SAW).

Ibn Taymiyyah, after accepting the authenticity of the hadith narrated by Zayd ibn Arqam in Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim, although seemingly skeptical, says: "This statement indicates that what is commanded to be adhered to and guarantees that adherence will prevent misguidance is only the Book of Allah. And so it came in another narration in Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim from Jabir…" He continues: "As for the phrase 'wa 'itratī,' they will not separate until they meet me at the pond, this addition is narrated by Imam al-Tirmidhī, and Ahmad has been asked about it, he weakened it. This addition has been weakened by many scholars, and they say it is not *ṣaḥīḥ*."

Ibn Quddāmah al-Maqdisī states that what is meant by *al-Thaqalayn* is the Qur'an and the Sunnah, not the Qur'an and *Ahlul Bayt*. This view is supported by another narration that says, "I leave among you two things which, if you hold onto them, you will not go astray: the Book of Allah and the Sunnah of His Messenger." Ibn Quddāmah emphasizes that *Ahlul Bayt* are specifically mentioned as witnesses to the Prophet's state.[53]

Al-Āmidī also views *al-Thaqalayn* as the Qur'an and the Sunnah, based on the narration mentioning "Kitabullah and my Sunnah".[54]

---

[52] Sulaymān Ibn Aḥmad Ibn Ayyūb Ibn Muṭīr Al-Khummī Al-Shāmī Al-Ṭabrānī, *Al-Mu'jam Al-Ṣaghīr*, ed. by Muḥammad Shakūr Maḥmūd Al-Ḥāh Amrīr (Dār 'Ammār, 1985), I, p. 73.

[53] Muwaffiq Al-Dīn 'Abdullah Ibn Aḥmad Ibn Quddāmah Al-Jamā'īl, *Rawḍat Al-Nāẓir Wa Junnat Al-Manāẓir Fī Uṣul Al-Fiqh 'Alā Madhhab Al-Imām Aḥmad Ibn Ḥanbal*, 2nd edn (Mu'assasat Al-Rayyān Li Al-Ṭibā'ah Wa Al-Nashr Wa Al-Tawzī', 2002), p. 470.

[54] Al-Andalusī, p. 308.

Ibn Taymiyyah explains that the Prophet mentioned that *Ahlul Bayt* and the Qur'an will never separate until they meet at *Hawd* (the Pond of Kausar). According to Ibn Taymiyyah, this indicates that the consensus of *Ahlul Bayt* is strong evidence, which is part of the overall consensus of the Muslim ummah.[55]

Ibn Ḥajar al-Haytamī acknowledges that in some authentic narrations, Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* mentions the Book of Allah and *Ahlul Bayt*. However, he also states that because the Sunnah explains the Qur'an, mentioning the Qur'an alone is sufficient, with *Ahlul Bayt* included in the context of preserving and teaching the Sunnah.[56]

Al-Mulā ‘Alī al-Qārī expresses that *Ahlul Bayt* is those who know the most about the Prophet and his teachings. In this context, *Ahlul Bayt* refers to the scholars who understand and practice the teachings of the Prophet.[57]

Al-Albānī criticizes the Shia interpretation of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* and states that *Ahlul Bayt* in this context are the righteous scholars who adhere to the Qur'an and the Sunnah. According to Al-Albani, mentioning *Ahlul Bayt* is akin to mentioning the Sunnah of the Rightly Guided Caliphs in the hadith that says, "Hold onto my Sunnah and the Sunnah of the Rightly Guided Caliphs".[58]

Thus, there are differing views among scholars regarding the meaning of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn*. Some scholars interpret it as referring to the Qur'an and *Ahlul Bayt*, while others understand it as referring to the Qur'an and the Sunnah. Despite these differing interpretations, all views emphasize the importance of following the correct teachings of Islam through the primary sources left by the Prophet (SAW).

From the Shia perspective, the narrations of Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* highlight the actions of the Prophet (SAW) towards Ali (AS) when delivering an important message at the end of his life. At the historic moment of Ghadir Khum after the Farewell Pilgrimage, the Prophet (SAW) raised Ali's (AS) hand and introduced him as the leader of the ummah after him. This is seen in various narrations, including those conveyed by Ummu Salamah, which explain that the Prophet (SAW) raised Ali's (AS) hand and stated that Ali is the mawlā (leader) for anyone who considers the Prophet (SAW) their mawlā.[59] The Prophet (SAW) also emphasized the importance of adhering to the Book of Allah and his *‘itrah*.

Additionally, the Prophet (SAW) directed the ummah to love and honor Ali (AS) as a solution to avoid misguidance. This is illustrated in the narration of Shaykh al-Islam al-Juwaynī, who mentions that the Prophet (SAW) declared Ali as Sayyidul Arab and asked the ummah to love him for the Prophet's sake and his honor.[60]

---

[55] Al-Ḥanbalī, VII, pp. 393–97.

[56] Aḥmad Ibn Aḥmad Ibn Muḥammad Ibn ‘Alī Ibn Ḥajar Al-Haytamī, *Al-Ṣawā‘iq Al-Muḥarraqah ‘Alā Ahl Al-Rafḍ Wa Al-Ḍalāl Wa Al-Zindiqah* (Mu'assasat Al-Risālah, 1997), II, p. 439.

[57] ‘Alī Ibn Ṣūlṭān Muḥammad Nūr Al-Dīn Al-Mulā Al-Hirawī Al-Qārī, *Mirqāt Al-Mafātīḥ Sharḥ Mishkāt Al-Maṣābīḥ* (Dār Al-Fikr, 2002), IX, p. 3975.

[58] Muḥammad Nāṣir Al-Dīn Al-Albānī, *Silsilat Al-Aḥādīth Al-Ṣaḥīḥah Wa Shay' Min Fiqhiha Wa Fawāidihā* (Maktabat Al-Ma‘ārif Li Al-Nashr Wa Al-Tawzī‘, 2002), IV, p. 260.

[59] ‘Alī ibn ‘Abdullah al-Ḥasanī Al-Samhūdī, *Jawāhir Al-‘Iqdayn Fī Faḍl al-Sharafayn Sharaf al-‘Ilm al-Jalī Wa al-Nasab al-‘Alī* (Wizārat al-Awqāf, 1948), p. 240.

[60] Ibrāhīm al-Juwaynī Al-Khurrāsānī, *Farā'id al-Simṭayn Fī Faḍā'il al-Murtaḍā Wa al-Butūl Wa al-Sabṭayn Wa al-A'immah Min Dhurriyyatihim ‘Alayhim al-Salām*, ed. by Muḥammad Bāqir Al-Maḥmūdī (Dār al-Ḥabīb, 1428), II, p. 196.

The Prophet (SAW) often prayed for goodness for those who love Ali (AS) and invoked evil upon those who hate him. In various narrations, the Prophet (SAW) prayed for Allah to love those who take Ali as their leader and to oppose those who oppose him.[61] These actions by the Prophet (SAW) emphasize the importance of Ali's (AS) role and underscore the necessity for the ummah to love and follow Ali (AS) to maintain their unity and faith.

These actions by the Prophet (SAW) reinforce the significance of Ali's (AS) role as his successor and highlight the need for Muslims to love and follow Ali (AS). To maintain the unity and faith of the ummah, the Prophet (SAW) emphasized the importance of adhering to the Book of Allah and his *'itrah* and prayed for goodness for the lovers of Ali and evil for those who hate him. Thus, Hadith *al-Thaqalayn* not only serves as a spiritual guide but also as an affirmation of Ali's (AS) authority and leadership in preserving the teachings and unity of the Muslim ummah.

C. Conclusion

This research on the Hadith of *al-Thaqalayn* highlights the complexity involved in evaluating its various versions, which either include the *'itrah* (family) of Prophet Muhammad (SAW) or focus solely on the Sunnah. Although some chains of transmission may be weak, the hadith still provides valuable insights. It is important for Shia adherents to recognize that their primary texts also emphasize the significance of adhering to both the Qur'an and the Sunnah. Sources such as *Al-Iḥtijāj*, *Bihār al-Anwār*, and *Al-Ṣirāṭ al-Mustaqīm* underscore this dual emphasis, aligning with Sunni perspectives that regard the Sunnah as a secondary source of Islamic law.

The doubts surrounding the Hadith of *al-Thaqalayn* despite its inclusion in reputable collections like Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim, underscore the broader theological divide between Sunni and Shia interpretations. The varied scholarly views on this hadith illustrate the rich diversity within Islamic tradition. A comprehensive understanding requires considering historical contexts, methodologies, and the broader scholarly discourse, which reflect both the complexity and unity of Islamic teachings.

References

Al-Albānī, Muḥammad Nāṣir Al-Dīn, *Silsilat Al-Aḥādīth Al-Ṣaḥīḥah Wa Shay' Min Fiqhiha Wa Fawāidihā* (Maktabat Al-Ma'ārif Li Al-Nashr Wa Al-Tawzī', 2002), IV

Al-Andalusī, 'Alī Ibn Aḥmad Ibn Sa'īd Ibn Ḥazm, *Al-Iḥkām Fī Uṣūl Al-Aḥkām* (Dār Al-Āfāq Al-Jadīdah, 1983)

Al-'Asqalānī, Abū al-Faḍl Aḥmad ibn Ḥajar, *Tahdhīb Al-Tahdhīb*, Jilid 1 (Mu'assasah Al-Risalah, 2014)

———, *Taqrīb Al-Tahdhīb*, Jilid 1 (Daar al-Rasyid, 1986)

Al-Bayāḍī, 'Alī Ibn Yūnus Al-'Āmilī Al-Nabāṭī, *Al-Ṣirāṭ al-Mustaqīm Ilā Mustaḥiqqī Al-Taqdīm* (Maṭba'at Al-Ḥaydarī), III

Al-Bayhaqī, Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn al-Ḥusayn, *Shu'ab al-Īmān*, Jilid 4 (Maktabah Al-Rushd, 2003)

---

[61] Al-Samhūdī, p. 240.

Al-Dhahabī, Shams al-Dīn Abū 'Abdillāh, *Al-Kāshif Fi Ma'rifati Man Lahu Riwāyah Fi al-Kutub al-Sittah*, Jilid 1 (Daar al-Qiblah Li al-Thaqafah al-Islamiyyah – Mu'assasah 'Ulum Al-Quran, 1992)

———, *Mīzān Al-I'tidāl Fī Naqd Al-Rijāl* (Dār Al-Ma'rifah Li Al-Ṭibā'ah Wa Al-Nashr, 1963)

Al-Habsyi, Ali Umar, *Dua Pusaka Nabi SAW. Al-Qur'an Dan Ahlulbait: Kajian Islam Autentik Pasca Kenabian* (Ilya, 2010)

Al-Ḥanbalī, Abū Al-'Abbās Taqiyy Al-Dīn Ibn Taymiyyah Al-Dimashqī, *Minhāj Al-Sunnah Al-Nabawiyyah Fī Naqḍ Kalām Al-Shī'ah Al-Qadariyyah*, ed. by Muḥammad Rashād Sālim (Jāmi'at Al-Imām Muḥammad Ibn Sa'ūd Al-Islāmiyyah, 1986), VII

Al-Haytamī, Aḥmad Ibn Aḥmad Ibn Muḥammad Ibn 'Alī Ibn Ḥajar, *Al-Ṣawā'iq Al-Muḥarraqah 'Alā Ahl Al-Rafḍ Wa Al-Ḍalāl Wa Al-Zindiqah* (Mu'assasat Al-Risālah, 1997), II

Al-Ḥillī, Abū Al-Qāsim Najm Al-Dīn Ja'far Ibn Al-Ḥasan, *Al-Mukhtaṣar Al-Nāfi' Fī Fiqh Al-Imāmiyyah*, Cetakan Ketiga (Mu'assat Al-Bi'thah, 1410)

Al-Jamā'īl, Muwaffiq Al-Dīn 'Abdullah Ibn Aḥmad Ibn Quddāmah, *Rawḍat Al-Nāẓir Wa Junnat Al-Manāẓir Fī Uṣūl Al-Fiqh 'Alā Madhhab Al-Imām Aḥmad Ibn Ḥanbal*, 2nd edn (Mu'assasat Al-Rayyān Li Al-Ṭibā'ah Wa Al-Nashr Wa Al-Tawzī', 2002)

Al-Khurrāsānī, Ibrāhīm al-Juwaynī, *Farā'id al-Simṭayn Fī Faḍā'il al-Murtaḍā Wa al-Butūl Wa al-Sabṭayn Wa al-A'immah Min Dhurriyyatihim 'Alayhim al-Salām*, ed. by Muḥammad Bāqir Al-Maḥmūdī (Dār al-Ḥabīb, 1428), II

Al-Kulaynī, Muhammad ibn Ya'qūb, *Uṣūl Al-Kāfī*, Jilid 1, Cetakan Ketiga (Dār al-Kutub al-Islāmiyyah, 1388)

Al-Majlisī, Muḥammad Bāqir, *Bihar Al-Anwar* (Mu'assasat al-Wafā', 1983), II

Al-Naysabūrī, Abū Al-Ḥusayn Muslim ibn Al-Hajjāj Al-Qushayrī, *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, Jilid 7 (Bayt Al-Afkār Al-Dawliyyah, 1998)

Al-Qārī, 'Alī Ibn Ṣūlṭān Muḥammad Nūr Al-Dīn Al-Mulā Al-Hirawī, *Mirqāt Al-Mafātīḥ Sharḥ Mishkāt Al-Maṣābīḥ* (Dār Al-Fikr, 2002), IX

Al-Qurashī, Abū al-Fidā' Ismā'īl ibn 'Umar ibn Kathīr, *Tafsīr Al-Qur'ān al-'Aẓīm*, ed. by Muḥammad Ḥusayn Syams Al-Dīn (Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 2004), VII

Al-Qurṭubī, Aḥmad ibn 'Umar ibn Ibrāhīm, *Al-Mufhim Limā Ashkala Min Kitāb Talkhīṣ Muslim* (Dār Ibn Kathīr, 1996), XX

Al-Rāzī, Abū Muḥammad 'Abd al-Rahmān ibn Muḥammad ibn Abī Ḥātim, *Al-Jarḥ Wa Al-Ta'dīl* (Dār Iḥyā' Al-Turāth Al-'Arabī, 1952)

Al-Sakhāwī, Syams al-Dīn Muḥammad ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān, *Al-Ajwibah al-Marḍiyyah Fīmā Su'ila al-Sakhāwī 'Anhu Min al-Aḥādīth al-Nabawiyyah*, Jilid 2, Cetakan Pertama (Daar Al-Rayah Li Al-Nasyr wa Al-Tawzi', 1418)

Al-Samhūdī, 'Alī ibn 'Abdullah al-Ḥasanī, *Jawāhir Al-'Iqdayn Fī Faḍl al-Sharafayn Sharaf al-'Ilm al-Jalī Wa al-Nasab al-'Alī* (Wizārat al-Awqāf, 1948)

Al-Sijistānī, Muḥammad Ibn Ḥibbān Ibn Aḥmad Ibn Ḥibbān, *Al-Majrūḥīn Min Al-Muḥaddithīn* (Dār Al-Ṣamī'ī, 2000)

Al-Ṭabarī, Abū Ja'far Muḥammad Ibn Jarīr, *Tārīkh Al-Rusul Wa Al-Muluk*, ed. by Muḥammad Abū Al-Faḍl Ibrāhīm (Dār Al-Ma'ārif, 1967)

Al-Ṭabrānī, Sulaymān Ibn Aḥmad Ibn Ayyūb Ibn Muṭīr Al-Khummī Al-Shāmī, *Al-Muʻjam Al-Ṣaghīr*, ed. by Muḥammad Shakūr Maḥmūd Al-Ḥāh Amrīr (Dār 'Ammār, 1985), I

Al-Ṭabrisī, Abū Mansūr Aḥmad Ibn 'Alī Ibn Abī Ṭālib, *Al-Ihtijaj 'Alā Ahl Al-Lajāj* (Maṭabi' Al-Nu'mān, 1966), II

Al-Tamīmī, Muḥammad ibn Ḥibbān ibn Aḥmad ibn Ḥibbān, *Al-Thiqāt*, Jilid 8 (Dairah Al-Ma'arif Al-Uthmaniyyah, 1973)

Al-Tirmidhī, Abū 'Īsā Muḥammad ibn 'Īsā, *Sunan Al-Tirmidhī*, ed. by Bashār 'Awwād Ma'rūf (Dār al-Gharb al-Islāmī, 1996)

Al-'Uqaylī, Abū Ja'far Muḥammad Ibn 'Amr Ibn Mūsā Ibn Ḥammād, *Kitāb Al-Ḍu'Afā' Al-Kabīr* (Dār Al-Kutub Al-'Ilmiyyah, 1984)

Azizan, Ahmad Salahuddin M., Zulhilmi Mohamed Nor, and Muhammad Akmalludin Mohd Hamdan, 'Metodologi Kritikan Sanad Riwayat Sirah: Satu Kajian Terhadap Akram Ḍiyā' Al-ʿumarī Dalam Karyanya Al-Sīrah Al- Nabawiyyah Al-Ṣaḥīḥah', *Journal Of Hadith Studies*, 2024, pp. 81–89, doi:10.33102/johs.v9i1.289

Babgure, Hesam, 'The Concept of Leadership in Sunni and Shia Perspectives', *Ampera: A Research Journal on Politics and Islamic Civilization*, 4.01 (2023), pp. 1–10, doi:10.19109/ampera.v4i01.22225

Baḥshal, Aslam Ibn Sahl Ibn Al-Razāz Al-Wāsiṭī, *Tārīkh Wāsiṭ* ('Ālam Al-Kutub, 1986)

Bāz, 'Abd al-'Azīz Ibn Bāz 'Abdullah Ibn, *Majmū' Fatāwā Wa Maqālāt Mutanawwi'ah*, ed. by Muḥammad ibn Sa'd Al-Shuway'ir (Dār al-Qāsim Li al-Nashr, 1420), III

Bloor, Michael, and Fiona Wood, *Keyword in Qualitative Methods* (SAGE Publication, 2006)

Hamid, Rahmat, Husni Idrus, and Hasaruddin Hasaruddin, 'Sunni and Shia: An Approach From Islamic Thought', *Jurnal Al-Dustur*, 6.1 (2023), pp. 50–71, doi:10.30863/aldustur.v6i1.3777

Hartono, Heki, 'Menyoal Hadis Tsaqalain Di Indonesia: Tentang Berpegang Teguh Pada Dua Peninggalan Rasulullah', *Islami[Dot]Co*, 2020 <https://islami.co/menyoal-hadis-tsaqalain-di-indonesia-tentang-berpegang-teguh-pada-dua-peninggalan-rasulullah/> [accessed 1 July 2024]

———, 'Relasi Kuasa Dalam Wacana Berpegang Teguh Kepada Dua Pusaka Peninggalan Rasulullah (Hadis Tsaqalain) Di Indonesia', *UNIVERSUM : Jurnal KeIslaman Dan Kebudayaan*, Vol 13, No 1 (2019), 2019

Hidayah, Nurul, Agneis Novirieka Harahap, Ibnopita Ibnopita, Ubed Muhtarom, and Tobroni Tobroni, 'Islamic Leadership Concepts and Theories', *FIKROTUNA: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Manajemen Islam*, 16.02 (2023), pp. 306–22, doi:10.32806/jf.v16i02.5708

Hidayat, Asep Achmad, Gelar Taufiq Kusumawardhana, Ading Kusdiana, Usman Supendi, Wawan Hernawan, and Chye Retty Isnendes, 'Ahlul Bait's First Arrival in Indonesia and The Exploration of Islamic History in Southeast Asia', *Al-Tsaqafa : Jurnal Ilmiah Peradaban Islam*, 20.2 (2023), pp. 172–93, doi:10.15575/al-tsaqafa.v20i2.29802

Irfanullah, Gumilar, Dewi Anggraeni, and Ina Agustina, 'Ahlul Bait Dalam Puisi-Puisi Penyair Keturunan Bani Umayyah: Studi Historis dan Kritik Sastra Atas Karya Abu Adiy al-Umawi, Marwan as-Saruji dan Al-Abiwardi', *Jurnal Tamaddun*, 11.2 (2023), doi:10.24235/tamaddun.v11i2.15218

Kamaluddin, Ahmad, 'Naqd As-Sanad : Metodologi Validasi Hadits Shahih', *MUSHAF JOURNAL: Jurnal Ilmu Al Quran Dan Hadis*, 3.2 (2023), pp. 229–39, doi:10.54443/mushaf.v3i2.136

Khair, Nurul, 'Peristiwa Ghadir Khum Dalam Pandangan Teolog Muslim', *Aqlania*, 11.2 (2020), p. 221, doi:10.32678/aqlania.v11i2.2811

Lestari, Lenni, 'Epistemologi Hadis Perspektif Syi'ah', *Al-Bukhari : Jurnal Ilmu Hadis*, 2.1 (2019), pp. 39–52, doi:10.32505/al-bukhari.v2i1.1130

Manan, Abdul, and Jovial Pally Taran, 'The Sunni-Shia Conflict in the History of Islam: An Analytical Descriptive Study', *Palita: Journal of Social Religion Research*, 5.2 (2020), pp. 165–82, doi:10.24256/pal.v5i2.1327

Masykuri, Fita Mustafida, Fahruddin Andriansyah, and Dian Mohammad Hakim, 'Sunni-Shia Conflict Resolution Strategy And Its Impact On Harmonizing The Society: Evidence From Sampang, Madura', *Al-Qanatir: International Journal of Islamic Studies*, 33.3 (2024), pp. 423–30

Mattori, Muhammad, 'Sikap Syiah Terhadap Sunnah/Hadis Nabi SAW', *Tahdis: Jurnal Kajian Ilmu Al-Hadis*, 13.1 (2022), pp. 54–64, doi:10.24252/tahdis.v13i1.26257

Miles, Matthew B., and A. Michael Huberman, *Qualitative Data Analysis*, Second Edition (SAGE Publication, 1994)

Muhid, Moh Imron, and Andris Nurita, 'Ke-'adalah-an Aisyah Perspektif Syiah dan Implikasinya Terhadap Hadis Nabi', *Al-Bukhari : Jurnal Ilmu Hadis*, 6.1 (2023), pp. 66–91, doi:10.32505/al-bukhari.v6i1.5309

Muzakky, Althaf Husein, and Agung Syaikhul Mukarrom, 'Studi Hadis Menghormati Ahlulbait: Dari Pemahaman Tekstualis Sampai Kontekstualis', *Riwayah: Jurnal Studi Hadis*, 7.1 (2021), pp. 67–88, doi:10.21043/riwayah.v7i1.8999

Nasrullah, Sanip, 'Authority of History and Sharah Hadith Thaqalayn (Sunnah Itrah)', *Journal of Hadith Studies*, 3.1 (2020), pp. 34–43, doi:10.32506/johs.v3i1.627

Noor, Dzulkifli, 'Kafa`ah Dalam Pandangan Ahlul Bait', *Emanasi : Jurnal Ilmu Keislaman dan Sosial*, 6.1 (2023), pp. 49–61

Nugroho, Kharis, 'Al-Kulaini's Canonization of Al-Kafi', *Tasfiyah: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam*, 6.1 (2022), pp. 115–42, doi:https://doi.org/10.21111/tasfiyah.v6i1.7620

Posha, Beti Yanuri, 'Penggunaan Hadis Ghadir Khum Sebagai Sumber Sejarah', *Jurnal SAMBAS (Studi Agama, Masyarakat, Budaya, Adat, Sejarah): Journal of Religious, Community, Culture, Costume, History Studies)*, 6.1 (2023), pp. 33–44, doi:10.37567/sambas.v6i1.1905

Rahman, Bobbi Aidi, 'The Event of Ghadir Khum: 'Ali Bin Abi Thalib's Leadership in Sunni and Shi'a Perspectives', *El-Afkar: Jurnal Pemikiran Keislaman Dan Tafsir Hadis*, 13.1 (2024), pp. 44–60, doi:10.29300/jpkth.v13i1.3452

Rifqi, Muhammad Hasan, and Ahmad Masyhur, 'The Legality of the Leadership of Abu Bakr, Umar, and Usman: The Ismaili and Zaidiyah Shia Perspectives', *Scientia*, 2.1 (2023), pp. 387–92, doi:10.51773/sssh.v2i1.181

Rizaka, Maghza, and Muhammad Wahid Hasyim, 'A Takhrīj Study of The Hadith Al-Thaqalayn in Sunan Al-Tirmidhī', *Jurnal Indonesia Sosial Teknologi*, 5.4 (2024), pp. 1723–36, doi:10.59141/jist.v5i4.1030

Rizaka, Maghza, Muhid Muhid, Andris Nurita, and Arfedin Hamas Khoshyatulloh, 'Interpretasi Imam Al-Kulaynī Terhadap Hadis Al-Thaqalayni Dalam Pendekatan Sosio-Historis', *TAJDID: Jurnal Ilmu Ushuluddin*, 22.2 (2023), pp. 359–85, doi:10.30631/tjd.v22i2.385

Rizaka, Maghza, Ahmad Fauzan Zahri, Nadia Maulida Mahbubiati, Achmadana Syachrizal M. F, and Aan Darwati, 'Kajian Asbāb Al-Wurūd Terhadap Hadis Al-Thaqalayn', *KACA (Karunia Cahaya Allah): Jurnal Dialogis Ilmu Ushuluddin*, 14.1 (2024), pp. 107–29, doi:10.36781/kaca.v14i1.587

Tahiiev, Akif, 'Female Leadership in Shia Islam: Women on the Way from Mujtahid to Marja'', *Societies*, 14.1 (2024), p. 2, doi:10.3390/soc14010002

Wensinck, Arnold John, *Al-Mu`jam Al-Mufahras Li Alfāẓ Al-Ḥadith Al-Nabawī*, Jilid 1 (Maktabah Brail, 1936)