Poor reading comprehension issue in EFL classroom among Indonesian secondary school students: Scrutinizing the causes, impacts and possible solutions

Dodi Widia Nanda *
Universitas Dharmas Indonesia, Dharmasraya, Indonesia
dodi.widiananda@gmail.com

Khairul Azmy
Universitas Islam Negeri Ar-Raniry, Banda Aceh, Indonesia
azmykhairul99@gmail.com

Manuscript received April 15, 2020, revised June 9, 2020, first published November 7, 2020, and available online November 9, 2020. DOI: 10.22373/ej.v8i1.6771

Recommended APA Citation

ABSTRACT

Reading comprehension is considered a challenging part of learning English for many Indonesian secondary school students. This study aims to explore the causes, impacts, and possible solutions for poor reading comprehension issues. The study scrutinizes the issue by reviewing previous studies, in which a number of articles and books were critically analyzed. The results indicate that poor reading comprehension occurs due to three remarkable factors, which are students’ lack of motivation, low prior knowledge, and poor English vocabulary. Moreover, this issue also leads to three main adverse impacts, such as reducing students’ learning achievement, hindering students’ problem-solving skills, and inhibiting students’ future studies and careers. Therefore, in responding to the problem above, this study proposes two learning approaches, which are the Cooperative Integrated and Reading Composition (CIRC) Technique and Metacognitive Strategy.

Keywords: Reading comprehension; CIRC; Metacognitive strategy; Reading issue

* Corresponding author
1. Introduction

Reading comprehension might be considered a challenging aspect of studying English for Indonesian secondary school students (Syahabuddin, Yusny, & Zahara, 2019). Most of the Indonesian students might not understand what they read in various English texts even though they have been learning English (Dahliana, 2016; Moriyanti, Muna, & Ismail, 2019; Syatriana, 2013; Usman, Fata, & Pratiwi, 2018). Moreover, Jayanti (2016) reveals that Indonesian secondary students often find difficulties in reading the information from texts. In contrast to the condition above, the newest Indonesian curriculum, the 2013 curriculum under the Regulation of the Ministry of Education and Culture 2013 of the Basic Competence of Senior High School and Junior High School mandates that Indonesian secondary students must comprehend various English texts such as recount, report, narrative and descriptive texts effectively (Ministry of Education and Culture, 2013).

Besides, previous studies have shown several causes and effects of poor reading comprehension. For instance, Hamra and Syatriana (2010) contend that poor reading comprehension among Indonesian secondary learners occurs due to students’ lack of vocabulary, learning support, and reading motivation. Whereas, Cahyono and Widiati (2006) conclude that poor prior knowledge also contributes to the low level of reading comprehension. In relation to the adverse effects of the related problem, Karanja (2015) reports that poor readers often have low self-esteem which results in their decreasing learning achievement. Also, poor reading comprehension can hinder problem-solving skills as well because people need to fully understand what they read in order to be competent problem solvers (Ozdemir, 2009). Ultimately, Cordeur (2010) and Park (2020) note that reading comprehension is the ability to remember important details and draw conclusions. These related skills are beneficial to participate in a democratic process such as finding jobs, passing an examination, and completing education (Barton, 2000, as cited in Arnbak, 2004).

Responding to the related condition, this study suggests two approaches to cope with the reading comprehension issue, which are the cooperative integrated reading and composition (CIRC) technique and the metacognitive theory. The former is suggested to cope with problems regarding students’ problem-solving skills and low motivation, while the latter is considered a suitable method to deal with students’ lack of vocabulary and low prior knowledge. A brief explanation of the two approaches is discussed in detail in the fundamental notion part of this paper.

Furthermore, the result of this investigation is hoped to offer a remarkable advantage for EFL students, English teachers, researchers, and Indonesian education stakeholders. The result of this study can be used as a self-reflection by EFL students to deal with the reading comprehension issue. In addition, EFL teachers and researchers can reflect on the solutions offered in this study to deal with the students’ reading comprehension issues in classrooms. At last, it is expected that this investigation can be utilized as a valuable guide for Indonesian policymakers in the educational field to
provide teacher training regarding teaching reading strategies for Indonesian English teachers to address the issue.

2. Literature review

Silawi, Shalhoub-Awwad, and Prior (2020) emphasize that reading comprehension has three components, which are process strategies (word recognition), prior knowledge and conceptual abilities. Beginner readers focus on process strategies, while skilled readers use abstract conceptual skills and utilize their prior knowledge efficiently to predict the given information in the text (Coady, 1979, as cited in Grabe, 1991). On the other hand, Jayanti (2016) concludes that students’ vocabulary knowledge, motivation, and strategy use are several factors which hinder the improvement of Indonesian students’ reading comprehension. Based on these notions, the paper attempts to synthesize the possible causes and impacts of the related problem. This paper argues that the causes consist of students’ lack of motivation, low prior knowledge and poor vocabulary, whereas the negative effects comprise decreasing students’ learning achievement, hindering students’ problem-solving abilities and inhibiting their future study and career.

Therefore, this paper also scrutinizes the viable solutions to deal with the related issue. The first approach offered in the investigation is the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique and the second approach is Metacognitive Theory. The CIRC is a part of the cooperative learning method implemented to alleviate the problems regarding students’ lack of motivation and problem-solving skills issues. The technique was firstly developed by Stevens, Madden, Slavin and Farnish (1987, as cited in Gonzales & Torres, 2015). Gupta and Ahuja (2014) reveal that CIRC is a comprehensive approach to instruction in reading. In the learning process, “students are taught in reading groups and then return to mixed ability teams to work one series of cooperative activities, including partner reading, making predictions, identification of characters, settings, problems and problem solutions, summary, spelling and reading comprehension exercises” (p. 39).

Furthermore, the metacognitive strategy is suggested to cope with the reduced reading comprehension issue regarding students’ poor vocabulary and lack of prior knowledge. Metacognition itself is defined as thinking about thinking in which students are required to do self-reflection during learning processes (Anderson, 2002). The metacognitive strategy is beneficial to create more profound learning and especially improve struggling learners’ performance (Anderson, 2002). Anderson (2002) divides a model of metacognition into five major components, which are “preparing and planning for learning, selecting and using learning strategies, monitoring strategy use, orchestrating various strategies and evaluating strategy use and learning” (p. 2).

3. Method

This study belongs to the type of literature study by scrutinizing previous
studies and theories that are relevant to the issue being investigated. The previous references obtained by means of research in the literature study serve as the basic foundation and main tool for the practice of field research. Furthermore, Bryman (2016) reveals that the literature study is a summary of articles from journals, books, and other documents that describe information. Moreover, Bryman (2016) postulates that a literature study is a method used to collect data or sources from previous studies.

Therefore, the study investigates a number of existed literature reviews. Several academic pieces of research and works were also critically analyzed. The literature was selected from various resources, such as academic journals and books, among others. The selected literature was discussed and evaluated to find the information. The information and evidence are used to build sound arguments in the study.

4. Findings and discussion
4.1. The causes of poor reading comprehension

The first factor linked to reading comprehension difficulties in the EFL context in Indonesian secondary students is students’ lack of motivation. The students are mostly not interested in reading and analyzing the English texts because they do not get used to doing the related activity in their daily routines. Moreover, Cahyono and Widiati (2006) claim that the declining interest of Indonesian students in comprehending English passages occur due to their learning habits. The students only read English texts if their teachers give an assignment (Cahyono & Widiati, 2006). Consequently, they lose their interest to do further reading comprehension activities. In line with the related opinion, Guthrie (2008, as cited in Sanford, 2015) notes that reading comprehension issue happens when students lose their interests and disengage from reading.

In addition, low prior knowledge has been considered as another cause of reading difficulties among Indonesian secondary students. Based on the students’ responses conducted in one of the senior high schools in Indonesia, Zuhra (2015) found that the students faced difficulties to comprehend English texts because they did not have sufficient prior knowledge to understand the given texts. The related phenomenon occurred since the lessons had not been appropriately learned and they had never read similar reading passages previously (Zuhra, 2015). In contrast with the related condition, to comprehend English passages, learners are required to draw inferences that rely on having rich prior knowledge (Neuman, Kaefar, & Pinkam, 2014). Hence, Indonesian learners will always find problems toward reading comprehension if they do not have enough prior knowledge.

Ultimately, the third contribution of the reading comprehension issue in Indonesian secondary students is poor vocabulary. Having limited vocabulary has been identified as an impairment of reading comprehension among Indonesian students (Floris & Divina, 2009; Garcia-Castro, 2020; Sutarsyah, 2008). Moreover, the Indonesian Government emphasizes that students must master between 2,500 to 3,000 English words to comprehend English academic texts; however, several studies show
that Indonesian learners were predicted to have only mastered 1,000 words (Sutarsyah, 2008). Consequently, the related circumstances lead to a low level of reading comprehension among Indonesian secondary students.

4.2. The adverse impacts of poor reading comprehension

The first negative effect of poor reading comprehension is decreasing students’ learning achievement. The decline of the students’ learning achievement occurs because they feel unconfident and have a low self-esteem after having difficulties in comprehending texts. Moreover, this type of reader often feels less valued in their classrooms. Guthrie and Davis (2003) and Widharyanto and Binawan (2020) reveal that many struggling readers in secondary school feel socially marginalized, and they do not intend to have peer relationships in a school environment. Struggling readers also often procrastinate their works and tend to avoid studying (Guthrie & Davis, 2003). As a consequence, this situation affects the students’ concentration on learning and gives way to reduce their learning achievement.

Secondly, hindering students’ problem-solving skills has been considered as another adverse effect of poor reading comprehension. It is likely to happen because reading is an essential step for solving a problem (Ozdemir, 2009). In other words, the students are asked to read and analyze texts first before addressing the problems or questions given in the texts (Mehl, 1985). The evidence supporting the view provided by Hite (2009), although all of her students could speak English, she still noticed that their students’ lack of reading accuracy and comprehension resulted in their difficulties to reach solutions to problems. Moreover, Danesh and Nourdad (2017) found that students with low problem-solving skills would always encounter difficulties in reading comprehension activities.

The third negative consequence of poor reading comprehension is inhibiting the students’ future studies and careers. This happens because students need English proficiency tests like the Test of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL) and an International English Language Testing System (IELTS) to enroll in tertiary education (Hung & Huang, 2019). The test is needed as well in a workplace such as having a work promotion (Mahmud, 2014). In this case, in both English proficiency tests, reading comprehension skills are tested. Jayanti (2016) and Korbasko (2020) note that many students faced difficulties in completing the reading comprehension section in English proficiency tests. As a result, the students failed to accomplish the given tests, causing them to postpone their studies or hinder them to find appropriate jobs.

After discussing and analyzing all of the causes and impacts of poor reading comprehension, this study proposes two main approaches to cope with the issue, which are the Cooperative and Integrative Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique and Metacognitive Strategy. The first approach is offered to cope with students’ issues regarding the students’ low problem-solving abilities and low motivation, while the latter is suggested to deal with the students’ problems regarding the lack of vocabulary.
and low prior knowledge. The detailed advantages of the two approaches are discussed in detail in the possible solutions part below.

4.3. The possible solutions
4.3.1. Cooperative integrated reading and composition (CIRC) technique

The first benefit of CIRC implementation is to enrich the students’ problem-solving abilities. This phenomenon happens since the students can share their own experiences, leading them to know about particular knowledge or information that they do not understand previously. Moreover, in CIRC activities, the students are required to work with their group members on a series of cognitive activities such as making a prediction, reading to one another, creating responses to stories, and even practicing decoding as well as vocabulary together (Slavin, 1996). In line with this, the CIRC technique is ideal to enhance the students’ abilities in problem-solving because they collaborate in groups for solving the given tasks (Khairun, 2013, as cited in Sundary, 2013). By doing this, it will automatically establish their problem-solving skills because they can elaborate and explore their understanding of each other from different insights.

Another advantage of the CIRC technique is to enhance the students’ motivation towards the learning process. Dividing students to collaborate in groups is a nature of CIRC activities which help and give them a convincing feeling that they can accomplish the given tasks and achieve the goals brilliantly. This confident feeling is often difficult to be achieved by the students if they work individually (Slavin, 1996). The evidence of the successful implementation of the technique towards the students’ confidence also happened in another EFL context, shown in a study conducted by Varisoglu (2016). The study indicated that Turkish students felt confident in group activities which resulted in the rise of their reading comprehension abilities (Varisoglu, 2016). Hence, based on the evidence above, it can be assumed that the implementation of CIRC may be effective as well to motivate the students if it is implemented in the Indonesian context since both Indonesia and Turkey use English as a foreign language (EFL).

However, a study conducted by Liu and Wang (2015) in English language learners at the 4th grade level in America shows a different outcome. The study revealed that the pupils performed better regarding reading comprehension abilities in independent learning methods compared to working in teams (Liu & Wang, 2015). This occurs, perhaps, because studying independently allows the pupils to read silently without the pressure of being distracted by their peers (Krashen, 2011, as cited in Liu & Wang, 2015). The related phenomenon is likely to happen because sometimes dividing students into group work activities lead the class to be noisy and they tend to have a chat with each other. As a consequence, they do not do the given work efficiently.

Another weakness in creating a cooperative learning activity is that the given technique is susceptible to lead personal clashes among the students. The study by Jarvela, Volet, and Järvenoja (2010) indicated that the students who were divided into groups tended to have different characteristics and goals which led to conflict among
them. Consequently, the circumstances would give rise to decreased motivation in learning. In a similar vein, Sun and Shen (2014) explain that dividing students into group learning activities is vulnerable to students’ clash because they often have different learning styles and purposes.

To refute the arguments above, it seems that distraction may not happen if it is implemented in Indonesian secondary school contexts since the secondary students are older compared to elementary students. Hence, the students will focus on doing reading activities which may result in the consistency of their reading comprehension achievement. This argument is supported by Slavin (1996) who notes that the CIRC technique has given a remarkable impact on the students’ achievement in reading comprehension in secondary schools. The consistent positive achievement has been counted in approximately 23 out of 30 related studies, which is equal to 77% (Slavin, 1996). Hence, it can be stated that there will be a high possibility of successful implementation if the technique is implemented in Indonesian secondary schools. Furthermore, concerning a noisy class and personal clash issues during the students’ group activities, teachers can anticipate them since the teachers’ role in CIRC activities is as a supervisor. The supervisors set up a learning design, monitor the students’ progress or development within the group activities, and provide feedback as well to them (Madden, 2004, as cited in Sundary, 2013).

In summary, it can be stated that the CIRC technique is beneficial to the students’ personal development. The related technique not only helps the students to build their prior knowledge but also strengthen their motivation to learn. These benefits will be suitable to cope with the students’ reading comprehension issues in Indonesian secondary students. On the other hand, during the CIRC implementation, the students in secondary contexts should be able to behave positively in the classroom compared to primary students. Moreover, the teachers can also act as supervisors and anticipate the related disruptions in the implementation of CIRC.

4.3.2. The metacognitive strategy

The metacognitive strategy is advantageous to enhance the students’ vocabulary. Metacognitive instruction teaches learners various learning techniques and tells the appropriate time to implement the related technique (Anderson, 2002). To exemplify, in a study conducted by Rasekh and Ranjbary (2003), they implemented various vocabulary learning approaches as a part of metacognitive instruction. The aim is to anticipate when one strategy is not working to enrich the students’ vocabulary; then, they are taught to find another suitable strategy (Rasekh & Ranjbary, 2003). By doing so, the students will comprehend several methods that they can implement to increase their vocabulary. It will automatically help the students to be aware of several unfamiliar words in English reading passages and improve their reading comprehension.

In addition, stimulating the students’ prior knowledge is considered as another benefit in implementing the metacognitive strategy. This happens because the
metacognitive strategy has preparation and planning components as explained by Anderson (2002). The related components require the students to prepare and plan their learning goals (Anderson, 2002). Hence, the students will be stimulated to think and reflect on the methods that they have to do for achieving their goals. The related circumstances will automatically train their problem-solving skills, and the related skill is crucial to increase their reading comprehension abilities. Another example of the usefulness of the metacognitive strategy is shown by the implementation of the Cognitive Academic Language Learning Approach (CALLA). The approach was proposed by Chamot and O’Malley (as cited in Rasekh & Ranjbary, 2003) in 1994. Both the metacognitive strategy and the CALLA approach are correlated with each other since both of them provide transitional instructions and ask the students to use learning strategies based on a cognitive model. CALLA lesson plans have a preparation phase in which the students are required to brainstorm what they already know about a particular topic and the students can relate it to the new ideas given in a lesson (O’Malley, 1988). As a consequence, the related activity can be used as regular training to enhance their prior knowledge.

On the other hand, implementing the metacognitive strategy may lead to adverse effects as well, particularly for the students who have low self-esteem. ALshammari (2015) reveals that the approach is not appropriate for the students with poor self-esteem because the metacognitive strategy requires the students to have a better understanding of the instructions and goals explained in a given task, and learners with poor self-esteem lack confidence to plan and evaluate their learning skills. Low self-esteem will hinder their improvement regarding reading comprehension skills as the students are asked to have good self-evaluation to comprehend a given passage. Moreover, a study conducted by Meniado (2016) on EFL college students in Saudi Arabia supports the argument above. The study indicated that there was no significant relationship between the implementation of the metacognitive strategy and the students’ reading comprehension improvement. In other words, the metacognitive strategy did not give a positive impact on EFL college students’ reading comprehension in Saudi Arabia (Meniado, 2016).

To challenge the argument above, this study argues that the metacognitive strategy is still beneficial to strengthen the students’ self-esteem. The reason is that the students are given well-organized and explicit instructions in the following related strategy. This argument is supported by a recent study conducted by Noghabaee (2016) in one of the high schools in Iran. The finding showed that the metacognitive strategy had a considerable impact on the students’ self-esteem (Noghabaee, 2016). The successful implementation occurred because the metacognitive strategy required the students to do self-evaluation and self-reflection during the learning activities which gave rise to their positive self-esteem (Noghabaee, 2016).

The ineffectiveness of the metacognitive strategy toward the students’ reading comprehension shown in a study conducted by Meniado (2016) in Saudi Arabia,
perhaps, happens due to two factors. The two factors are the different contexts of implementation and the kinds of metacognitive strategies used in the related investigation. A different result may happen if it is implemented in Indonesian secondary schools because Cahyono and Widiati (2006) state that the teaching of English at tertiary institutions is different compared to secondary schools regarding status, number of hours, instructional objective and teaching method. This argument is supported by another study conducted by Alaraj (2015) in Saudi Arabia, which investigated it in a secondary school context and used a think-aloud technique as part of the metacognitive strategy. The finding showed that the metacognitive strategy improved the students’ reading comprehension (Alaraj, 2015). Hence, it is very likely that the successful implementation of the metacognitive strategy can occur to enhance the students’ reading comprehension in Indonesian secondary school contexts. To support this argument, Fitrisia, Kok, and Yusuf (2015) found that metacognitive awareness in reading strategies has been effective to enhance the reading comprehension skills in Indonesian secondary school students.

In brief, the implementation of the metacognitive strategy is like two sides of a coin. The related strategy may offer a positive impact on the students’ reading comprehension skills. On the other hand, the strategy may yield less effective improvement in the students’ reading comprehension skills. However, the effectiveness of the metacognitive strategy can be increased or maximized by choosing an appropriate technique that links with the metacognitive strategy to deal with poor reading comprehension issues.

5. Conclusion

Poor reading comprehension in the EFL context among Indonesian secondary school students is a debilitating problem affected by three significant factors: the students’ lack of motivation, low prior knowledge, and poor English vocabulary. This issue also triggers three primary adverse consequences which affect the students’ development both inside and outside the classroom such as decreasing students’ learning achievement, hindering students’ problem-solving skills and inhibiting their future studies and careers. This study proposes two suggested approaches to alleviate the problem: cooperative integrated reading and composition (CIRC) technique and metacognitive strategy. Based on the related literature discussed in the investigation, it is found that the CIRC technique is effective to address the students’ problems regarding lack of motivation and problem-solving skills. The metacognitive strategy may be advantageous to enhance the students’ vocabulary acquisition and establish their prior knowledge. Consequently, all the main causes of poor reading comprehension issues in Indonesian secondary schools can be solved by implementing the two approaches.

However, personal clashes among the students and a noisy class are considered to be the negative effects in implementing CIRC, whereas the metacognitive strategy is
not suitable to be implemented for the students with poor self-esteem. The investigation has found that all of those weaknesses may not be an issue if the teachers and students work together to comprehend the teaching procedures and goals of the two approaches. Therefore, both CIRC and metacognitive strategies are considered effective methods to tackle Indonesian secondary students’ issues in comprehending English texts.

6. Limitation and recommendation

This study aims to scrutinize several previous studies concerning the causes, impacts, and possible solutions for poor reading comprehension issues in Indonesian secondary school students. However, some previous studies were analyzed from different countries which may or may not be applicable in the Indonesian context. This occurs because the researchers intend to globalize the issue in order to build sound arguments. It also happens due to the lack of references regarding the issue from the Indonesian context. Therefore, it is recommended that further research be carried out to investigate the use of the CIRC technique and metacognitive strategy in dealing with the students’ poor reading comprehension in Indonesia.

References


Syahabuddin, K., Yusny, R., & Zahara, N. (2019). Teacher teaching styles in introducing concept mapping strategy in reading comprehension activity at senior high schools in


