



## **The Development of Academic Identity in the Patriarchal Society through Doctoral Student Communities**

Jarjani Usman,<sup>1</sup> Fakhri Yacob,<sup>1</sup> Nuralam Syamsuddin,<sup>1</sup> Murni Ishak,<sup>1</sup> Alimuddin<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Universitas Islam Negeri Ar-Raniry Banda Aceh, Indonesia

Email: jarjani@ar-raniry.ac.id

### **Abstract**

The development of academic identity among doctoral students has become increasingly important, as it influences their future roles as scholars. Although this transition has been widely studied, the experiences of doctoral students in patriarchal Indonesian societies remain underexplored. This study examined the experiences of twelve male and female doctoral students at six Indonesian universities, focusing on the challenges and barriers they faced while developing their scholarly identities. Using narrative inquiry, the research captured the perspectives of students from Sumatra and Java. The findings indicate that students formed communities to support their academic identity, gaining both academic and psychological benefits through peer interaction. However, these communities were often unsupportive unless lecturers provided guidance, involved students in research, or encouraged participation in conferences and external groups. While all students recognized the importance of academic communities, many could not participate regularly due to full-time employment, childcare, domestic responsibilities (particularly for women), social obligations, and distance from campus. So in conclusion, there is a slight influence of patriarchal culture on the participation of women in academic communities. Postgraduate programs should therefore promote community development to help students build scholarly identities and address psychological and cognitive challenges during their studies.

**Keywords:** Community of practice, doctoral students, patriarchal society, academic identity

### **Abstrak**

*Pengembangan identitas akademik di antara mahasiswa doktoral menjadi semakin penting, karena hal ini memengaruhi peran mereka di masa depan sebagai cendekiawan. Meskipun transisi ini telah banyak diteliti, pengalaman mahasiswa doktoral di masyarakat patriarki Indonesia masih kurang dieksplorasi. Penelitian ini menelaah pengalaman dua belas mahasiswa doktoral laki-laki dan perempuan di enam universitas di Indonesia, dengan fokus pada tantangan dan hambatan yang mereka hadapi saat mengembangkan identitas keilmuan mereka. Dengan menggunakan pendekatan naratif, penelitian ini menangkap perspektif mahasiswa dari Sumatra dan Jawa. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa mahasiswa membentuk komunitas untuk mendukung identitas akademik mereka, memperoleh manfaat baik akademik maupun psikologis melalui interaksi dengan sesama mahasiswa. Namun, komunitas-komunitas ini seringkali tidak mendukung kecuali dosen memberikan bimbingan, melibatkan mahasiswa dalam penelitian, atau mendorong partisipasi dalam konferensi dan kelompok eksternal. Meskipun semua mahasiswa menyadari pentingnya komunitas akademik, banyak yang tidak dapat berpartisipasi secara teratur karena pekerjaan penuh waktu, mengurus anak, tanggung jawab rumah tangga (terutama bagi wanita), kewajiban sosial, dan jarak dari kampus. Jadi kesimpulannya, ada sedikit pengaruh budaya patriarkis dalam keikutsertaan kaum perempuan dalam komunitas akademis. Oleh karena itu, program pascasarjana sebaiknya mendorong pengembangan komunitas untuk membantu mahasiswa membangun identitas keilmuan dan mengatasi tantangan psikologis serta kognitif selama masa studi mereka.*

**Kata kunci:** *Komunitas praktik, mahasiswa doktoral, masyarakat patriarkal, identitas akademik*

### **Introduction**

Identity plays a crucial role in the development of early career researchers, particularly for doctoral students who must transition into scholars through a demanding and extensive process. The scholarly identity development from doctoral students to scholars in many parts of the world is complex and challenging.<sup>1</sup> They mostly experience significant personal struggles throughout their programs,<sup>2</sup> especially during their tough efforts of solely consuming knowledge to produce knowledge. The transformation involves generating original contributions within

---

<sup>1</sup> Rebecca Rockinson-Szapkiw, Amanda; Spaulding, Lucinda S.; Lunde, "Women in Distance Doctoral Programs: How They Negotiate Their Identities as Mothers, Professionals, and Academics in Order to Persist," *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 12 (2017), p. 49–71.

<sup>2</sup> Rockinson-Szapkiw, Amanda, Lucinda S. Spaulding, and Rebecca Lunde. "Women in distance doctoral programs: How they negotiate their identities as mothers, professionals, and academics in order to persist." *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 12 (2017), p. 49.

their fields, requiring cycles of thinking, writing, feedback, and revision.<sup>3</sup> To support their students, doctoral programs need to help students develop their capacity to contribute significant new knowledge,<sup>4</sup> including socializing them into academic practices and enabling them to gradually adopt the scholar identity.<sup>5</sup>

However, given the support, not all doctoral students successfully navigate this path. Around 40 to 60 percent of doctoral students experience motivation-related attrition in the United States and Canada.<sup>6</sup> Research indicates that some abandon their pursuits<sup>7</sup> or face termination due to factors such as an inability to produce original work, psychological issues, and financial difficulties.<sup>8</sup> Many studies highlight that doctoral candidates experience increased psychological distress throughout their programs.<sup>9</sup> Especially for women, as parenting students experience higher levels of stress and pressure during their degree pursuit than their non-parenting counterparts.<sup>10</sup> In this regard, LeBlanc et al. found in their research on women's friendships for support, the role of narratives in reshaping family stories, and the need for higher education to assist mother scholars.<sup>11</sup> Therefore, it is necessary for universities to prioritize support for students within their doctoral programs, particularly through engagement with scholarly communities. Similar

---

<sup>3</sup> Kelsey S. Inouye and Lynn McAlpine, "Developing Scholarly Identity: Variation in Agentive Responses to Supervisor Feedback," *Journal of University Teaching and Learning Practice* 14, no. 2 (2017).

<sup>4</sup> Kelsey Inouye and Lynn McAlpine, "Developing Academic Identity: A Review of the Literature on Doctoral Writing and Feedback," *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 14 (2019), p. 1–31.

<sup>5</sup> Linds Roberts, "'This Is Just What We Do': PhD Students on Becoming Scholars in a Community of Practice," *Communications in Information Literacy* 15, no. 1 (2021), p. 75–94.

<sup>6</sup> Hermayawati, Hermayawati. "Analyzing the Doctoral Candidates' Level of Efforts to 'Leapfrog' Their Dissertation Accomplishment Needs." *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research* 24.2 (2025).

<sup>7</sup> Donna H Kennedy et al., "The Qualitative Report A Grounded Theory of Persistence in a Limited-Residency Doctoral Program Recommended APA Citation" 20 (2015), p. 3–9.

<sup>8</sup> Shosh Leshem, "Identity Formations of Doctoral Students on the Route to Achieving Their Doctorate," *Issues in Educational Research* 30, no. 1 (2020), p. 169–86; E. van Rooij, M. Fokkens-Bruinsma, and E. Jansen, "Factors That Influence PhD Candidates' Success: The Importance of PhD Project Characteristics," *Studies in Continuing Education* 43, no. 1 (2021), p. 48–67; Leshem, "Identity Formations of Doctoral Students on the Route to Achieving Their Doctorate."

<sup>9</sup> Cassie M. Hazell et al., "Understanding the Mental Health of Doctoral Researchers: A Mixed Methods Systematic Review with Meta-Analysis and Meta-Synthesis," *Systematic Reviews* 9, no. 1 (2020), p. 1–30.

<sup>10</sup> Rockinson-Szapkiw, Amanda; Spaulding, Lucinda S.; Lunde, "Women in Distance Doctoral Programs: How They Negotiate Their Identities as Mothers, Professionals, and Academics in Order to Persist."

<sup>11</sup> L. LeBlanc, S. S., Spradley, E., Beal, H. O., Burrow and C. Cross, "Being Dr. Mom and/or Mom, Ph.D.: Autoethnographies of Mother Scholaring during COVID-19," *New Horizons in Adult Education and Human Resource Development* 34, no. 3 (2022), p. 28–39.

recommendation was also provided by Wahidah et al.<sup>12</sup> and Hermayawati<sup>13</sup> to improve the quality assurance of postgraduate doctoral education in Indonesia.

In academic discourse, a scholarly community, or a Community of Practice (CoP), also referred to as learning networks, thematic groups, or tech clubs,<sup>14</sup> consists of three key elements: a domain, a community, and a practice. CoPs are “voluntary groups of people who, sharing a common concern or passion, come together to explore these concerns and ideas and share and grow their practice”.<sup>15</sup> In this regard, Lave and Wenger<sup>16</sup> concluded that learning is most effective within a community of apprentices and experienced workers, rather than through the mere transmission of facts in a master/apprentice relationship.<sup>17</sup> The domain signifies a shared area of interest among members, which in this case formed during their doctoral studies and continues as they meet to advance their doctoral programs.

The effectiveness of a CoP hinges on members' willingness to share resources and address each other's challenges.<sup>18</sup> The community aspect involves individuals engaging in joint activities, supporting one another, and exchanging information to further their common interests. Motivated by the desire to enhance their professional development, members learn collaboratively through interactions. The practice encompasses the sharing of resources, experiences, and strategies to tackle recurring issues, allowing for the development of a collective practice. A CoP persists as long as members are committed to their professional growth.

Social communities facilitate identity development and learning.<sup>19</sup> Lave and Wenger<sup>20</sup> introduced the community of practice (CoP) model to support this process through “legitimate peripheral participation,” where newcomers gradually transition to full membership by adopting the community’s identity, practices, tools, and

---

<sup>12</sup> Wahidah, Evita Yuliatul, Sangkot Sirait, and Erika Setyanti Kusumaputri. "Doctoral Student Experiences in Indonesian Postgraduate Programs: A Phenomenological Investigation of Challenges." *AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan* 15.4 (2023), p. 4250-4261.

<sup>13</sup> Hermayawati, Hermayawati. "Analyzing the Doctoral Candidates' Level of Efforts to 'Leapfrog' Their Dissertation Accomplishment Needs." *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research* 24.2 (2025).

<sup>14</sup> Clare McCluskey-Dean, "Identifying and Facilitating a Community of Practice in Information Literacy in Higher Education," *A PhD Thesis* (Robert Gordon University, 2020).

<sup>15</sup> B. Mercieca, "What Is a Community of Practice?," in *Communities of Practice*, ed. A. McDonald, J., Cater-Steel (Singapore: Springer, 2017), 2–25.

<sup>16</sup> Lave and Wenger, *Situated Learning: Legitimate Peripheral Participation*.

<sup>17</sup> Lave and Wenger.

<sup>18</sup> Fan Chuan Tseng and Feng Yang Kuo, "A Study of Social Participation and Knowledge Sharing in the Teachers' Online Professional Community of Practice," *Computers and Education* 72 (2014), p. 37–47.

<sup>19</sup> Inouye and McAlpine, "Developing Academic Identity: A Review of the Literature on Doctoral Writing and Feedback."

<sup>20</sup> Lave and Wenger, *Situated Learning: Legitimate Peripheral Participation*.

language.<sup>21</sup> In CoPs, it depends on active participation enables their members like students to co-create knowledge.<sup>22</sup> Wenger-Trayner and Wenger-Trayner define CoPs as groups of individuals who share a common passion or concern and improve their skills through regular interaction. The CoP theory highlights that sharing practices enhances members' learning and professional identity, involving both "old timers" (experienced practitioners) and "newcomers," whose identities can evolve collaboratively within the community.

Research has identified numerous benefits of CoPs for developing scholarly identity. For example, Robert found that students in CoPs supported them to redefine their understanding of research and writing as social journeys involving professional learning and identity growth rather than mere tasks to complete.<sup>23</sup> Lassig et al.<sup>24</sup> discovered that participation in writing groups led to significant and lasting changes in students' identities, enhanced self-efficacy and writing confidence, and reduced feelings of isolation. Park and Schallert<sup>25</sup> examined how doctoral students formed their professional identities during candidacy. It revealed a model of emerging identity shaped by four interrelated processes: assessing the alignment of past and present identities, developing disciplinary knowledge and skills, envisioning a future self, and imagining one's role within a CoP.

Previous studies have also shown that a strong community enhances academic outcomes through increased participation and deeper learning, while also fostering social benefits like improved stress management and overall well-being.<sup>26</sup> These communities shape scholarly identities<sup>27</sup> promote social closeness essential for retention,<sup>28</sup> offer protection against isolation and disengagement,<sup>29</sup> and aid in

---

<sup>21</sup> Roberts, Linds. "'This Is Just What We Do': PhD Students on Becoming Scholars in a Community of Practice." *Communications in Information Literacy* 15, no. 1 (2021), p. 75–94.

<sup>22</sup> Lave and Wenger, *Situated Learning: Legitimate Peripheral Participation*.

<sup>23</sup> Robert, Linds "'This Is Just What We Do': PhD students on becoming scholars..."

<sup>24</sup> L. H. Lassig, C. J., Dillon and C. M. Diezmann, "Student or Scholar? Transforming Identities through a Research Writing Group," *Studies in Continuing Education* 35, no. 3 (2013), p. 299–314.

<sup>25</sup> John Jongho Park and iane L. Schallert, "Reciprocity between Doctoral Students' Emerging Professional Identity and Their Envisionment of a Possible Future Self in Real and Imagined Communities of Practice," *Learning, Culture and Social Interaction Volume 26, September 2020, 100434* 26 (2020), p. 100434.

<sup>26</sup> Sharla Berry, "Teaching to Connect: Community-Building Strategies for the Virtual Classroom," *Online Learning Journal* 23, no. 1 (2019), p. 164–83.

<sup>27</sup> Leshem, "Identity Formations of Doctoral Students on the Route to Achieving Their Doctorate."

<sup>28</sup> Sharla Berry, "Student Support Networks in Online Doctoral Programs: Exploring Nested Communities," *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 12 (2017), p. 33–48..

<sup>29</sup> Michelle A. Drouin, "The Relationship between Students' Perceived Sense of Community and Satisfaction, Achievement, and Retention in an Online Course," *Quarterly Review of Distance Education* 9, no. 3 (2008), p. 267–84.

managing anxiety and depression.<sup>30</sup> They also support students in navigating autonomy, independence, and competence.<sup>31</sup>

However, research on the role of doctoral student communities in fostering scholarly identity in patriarchal societies, as perceived by female and male students in Indonesia, is still scarce. Understanding the characteristics of patriarchal societies for this research is crucial because of the involvement of respondents from these cultural backgrounds. Indonesian society is categorized into the society that embrace patriarchy culture,<sup>32</sup> which is a social system where men predominantly hold positions of authority. Patriarchy is a powerful ideology and cultural norm that tightly control women in all domains of society.<sup>33</sup> Previous studies also show that patriarchal norms remain strong in Indonesia<sup>34,35</sup> and parents, especially mothers, are more responsible for their children education.<sup>36</sup> Men frequently cite the exegesis of Quran (4:34) as the foundation of patriarchy in Muslim societies, where men hold authority over women.<sup>37</sup> For instance, women may be prohibited from leaving home without their husband's permission. Others contend, however, that this perspective originates from pre-Islamic traditions rather than from Islam itself.<sup>38</sup>

Studies revealed that women's multiple identities, such as mothers, educators, and others, impact their scholarly identity.<sup>39</sup> Women who are undertaking

<sup>30</sup> J. Stubb, K. Pyhältö, and K. Lonka, "Balancing between Inspiration and Exhaustion: PhD Students' Experienced Socio-Psychological Well-Being," *Studies in Continuing Education* 33, no. 1 (2011), p. 33–50.

<sup>31</sup> Michael Jones, "Issues in Doctoral Studies -Forty Years of Journal Discussion: Where Have We Been and Where Are We Going?," *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 8 (2013), p. 83–104.

<sup>32</sup> Pam Nilan and Argyo Demartoto, "Patriarchal Residues in Indonesia: Respect Accorded Senior Men by Junior Men," *European Journal of Social Sciences* 31, no. 2 (2012), p. 279–93.

<sup>33</sup> Ernanda Ernanda, "Challenging the Patriarchal Culture; Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis of the Indonesian Environmental Heroines," *Wacana* 24, no. 1 (2023), p. 58–86..

<sup>34</sup> Mafrukha, Wahyu Nisawati, et al. "Smoking, Hijab and Gender Identity: Social Jurisprudence Perspective on Indonesian Muslim Women in Café Bars." *AL-IHKAM: Jurnal Hukum & Pranata Sosial* 20.1 (2025), p. 116-143.

<sup>35</sup> Yunita Amraeni et al., "A Matriarchal and Patriarchal Perception on Women's Autonomy in Decision Making on Contraception: Qualitative Analysis in Indonesia," *Malaysian Journal of Medicine and Health Sciences* 17 (2021), p. 17–21.

<sup>36</sup> Aminudin, Aminudin, and Hasan Hasan. "The Role of Teachers and Parents in The Formation of Children's Character in Schools: A Study in Southeast Sulawesi, Islamic Family Law Perspective." *El-Usrah: Jurnal Hukum Keluarga* 8.1 (2025).

<sup>37</sup> Baharudin, Rahmawati. "Patrarkhi dalam Sistem Keluarga Muslim Tradisional." *Ijtihad: Jurnal Wacana Hukum Islam dan Kemanusiaan* 10.1 (2010), p. 69-88.

<sup>38</sup> Baharuddin, Rahmawati “.

<sup>39</sup> Lauren E. Burrow et al., "The Skits, Sketches, and Stories of MotherScholars," *Qualitative Report* 25, no. 12 (2020), p. 4245–73.R. Mirick and S. Wladkowski, "Women's Experiences with Parenting during Doctoral Education," *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 15 (2008), p. 89–109; Burrow et al., "The Skits, Sketches, and Stories of MotherScholars; Susan Ledger Mason,

doctoral program need to comply with their multiple identities as mothers, wives, academics, and doctoral students at the same time, which made them imperfectly weave motherhood and doctoral studies. Doctoral mums may have a wish to be both of mothers and researchers,<sup>40</sup> even though they are overwhelmed.<sup>41</sup> For instance, they could not fully participate in their studies due to having to take care of their toddlers. In Acehese society in Indonesia, this may be exacerbated as people embrace patriarchal ideology. In Acehese society, adults' participation in social activities is highly encouraged. This includes various funerals-related ceremonies (such as the 1st, 2nd, 3rd, 4th, 5th, 7th, 14th, 30th, and annual ceremonies), marriage, and other religious related activities. Women's responsibility in patriarchal societies to attend these ceremonies is higher because they also need to do domestic work. The demanding nature of the many ceremonies in their society may affect their participation in their doctoral learning communities.

Understanding these influences on doctoral students in their transition to scholars is crucial as they impact student engagement in community activities. It is essential because many doctoral programs lack opportunities for social engagement and do not foster the social inclusion of postgraduate students.<sup>42</sup> Therefore, this study aims to address this gap by examining the practices of doctoral students' communities of practice and exploring their perceived effects and challenges in developing as scholars at Indonesian universities.

This study employed a qualitative method design using narrative inquiry. Narrative inquiry is a valuable method for capturing the diverse lived experiences of doctoral students as valid sources of knowledge. A narrative serves as a gateway through which individuals explore the world, interpret their experiences, and assign significance to them.<sup>43</sup> Craig<sup>44</sup> notes that the story can uncover reality and highlight issues that paradigms cannot. Moreover, narrative inquiry is especially relevant for

---

Shannon, Melissa Bond, "How Motherhood Enhances and Strains Doctoral Research/Ers," *Journal of Further and Higher Education* 47, no. 8 (2023), p. 1087–1105.

<sup>40</sup> Jenna S. Abetz, "'I Want to Be Both, but Is That Possible?': Communicating Mother-Scholar Uncertainty During Doctoral Candidacy," *Journal of Women and Gender in Higher Education* 12, no. 1 (2019), p. 70–87.

<sup>41</sup> Kimberlee Yalango, "'Stretched Thin': Pregnancy and Motherhood in Clinical and Counseling Psychology Doctoral Programs" (University of Denver, 2019).

<sup>42</sup> Azad Ali and Frederick G Kohun, "Cultural Influence on Social Isolation in Doctoral Programs and Doctoral Attrition-A Case Study," *Information Systems Education Journal* 7, no. 64 (2009), p. 2–7.

<sup>43</sup> F. M. Connelly and D. J. Clandinin, *Shaping a Professional Identity: Stories of Education Practice* (Althouse Press, 1999).

<sup>44</sup> Cheryl J. Craig, "Metaphors of Knowing, Doing and Being: Capturing Experience in Teaching and Teacher Education," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 69 (2018), p. 300–311.

researching the concepts of “human beings” and “becoming”<sup>45</sup>, making it suitable for understanding the journey of becoming a doctoral scholar. It is commonly used in qualitative research because it enables the description of behaviors, motivations, and emotions.<sup>46</sup> These descriptions are significant in qualitative research as they convey aspects of experience that are often not explicitly articulated.<sup>47</sup>

To collect data, we interviewed representatives from the doctoral programs of six universities regarding their written policies on Communities of Practice (CoPs) for doctoral students' identity development. Participants were invited to share their narratives about their experiences throughout their doctoral programs. Before the interviews, a consent form was distributed to each participant. Twelve doctoral students and alumni from six public and Islamic universities in Aceh, Jakarta, and Yogyakarta consented to participate in this research. They were aged 30 to 59 and represented various postgraduate departments. Participants were recruited through WhatsApp with help from the doctoral program heads, and interviews were conducted either face-to-face or by phone. All interviews were in Bahasa Indonesia, recorded, manually transcribed, and translated into English.

The data were thematically analyzed by identifying recurring patterns presented as themes reflective of the data.<sup>48</sup> Data collected from interviews of the doctoral students were analysed, as suggested by Braun and Clarke<sup>49</sup> and Riessman,<sup>50</sup> ranging from understanding the data by reading them back and forth, generating initial codes through which many codes were extracted from the transcripts, searching for themes, reviewing the themes, and defining and naming themes.

## **The Academic Communities in Indonesian Higher Education No Formal Academic Communities**

Many students recognized that student communities facilitate them to succeed academically, even if these groups were not officially organized. Even though some doctoral students involved in this research initially stated that they did not have the communities, they did. Male and female doctoral students at six

---

<sup>45</sup> Aaron Samuel Zimmerman and Jeong-Hee Kim, “Excavating and (Re)Presenting Stories: Narrative Inquiry as an Emergent Methodology in the Field of Adult Vocational Education and Technology,” *International Journal of Adult Vocational Education and Technology (IJAVET)* 8, no. 2 (2022), p. 16–28.

<sup>46</sup> Sarah J. Tracy, *Qualitative Research Methods: Collecting Evidence, Crafting Analysis, Communicating Impact* (John Wiley & Sons, 2024).

<sup>47</sup> Emily Ford, “Tell Me Your Story: Narrative Inquiry in LIS Research,” *College and Research Libraries* 81, no. 2 (2020), p. 235–47.

<sup>48</sup> C. R. Lochmiller, “Conducting Thematic Analysis with Qualitative Data,” *The Qualitative Report* 26, no. 6 (2021), p. 2029–44.

<sup>49</sup> V. Braun and V. Clarke, “Thematic Analysis Revised,” *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling* 53, no. 9 (2019), p. 1689–99.

<sup>50</sup> Riessman, Catherine Kohler. *Narrative methods for the human sciences* (Sage, 2008).

Indonesian universities in three different regions (Banda Aceh, Jakarta, and Yogyakarta) reported a lack of specific policies from postgraduate programs of their universities to foster their identity development.<sup>51</sup> Nevertheless, they emphasized the importance of communicating with each other to cultivate learning communities that support their academic growth. They expressed a strong commitment to helping fellow students build their scholarly identities during their studies.

One of the doctoral students from AU2 said, “We were not required by the postgraduate program to form doctoral student learning communities, but we feel that our community is important for supporting our communication and learning. Sometimes we communicate face-to-face, sometimes we use WhatsApp groups.”<sup>52</sup> Another female student of YU2 state that they built their communities to support one another during their doctoral programs. They held meetings regularly in the weekend, usually in the university libraries.<sup>53</sup> This suggests that the doctoral students regardless of their gender felt indispensable to establish communities among them during their study. This is supported by LeBlanc et al.’s research finding that the value of women colleagues and friendships for social support effectively assist mother scholars in their doctoral programs.<sup>54</sup>

Several accounts from students enrolled at various universities in Yogyakarta indicate that most doctoral students in the region participate in academic communities both within and beyond their institutions.<sup>55</sup> The presence of multiple universities, including public, Islamic, and private institutions situated in close proximity, enables frequent interaction among students. Additionally, various communities regularly organize discussions on specific topics or theories, which are open to individuals with shared academic interests regardless of gender. Participation in these communities enhances students' knowledge and supports the development of their scholarly identities.

Another female student of YU2 also expressed that she was no longer young and her memory had begun to weaken, so it was necessary to collaborate within a community in learning together. Community is very important because when you join, you feel that you are not alone in struggling. A great struggle is a logical consequence of the desire to achieve the hope of becoming a scientist in one's respective field. However, she also realizes that her responsibilities to the family as a mother cannot be ignored.

---

<sup>51</sup> An interview with participants of AU1, AU2, JU1, JU2, YU1, and YU2

<sup>52</sup> An interview with P1 of AU1.

<sup>53</sup> An interview with P5 of YU2.

<sup>54</sup> L. LeBlanc, S. S., Spradley, E., Beal, H. O., Burrow, and C. Cross, “Being Dr. Mom and/or Mom, Ph.D.: Autoethnographies of MotherScholaring during COVID-19.

<sup>55</sup> An interview with P5 and P6 of YU1 and YU2.

Overall, research indicates that most students were aware of the value of an academic communities, even though some communities are more social. However, the academic climate at each university, students' personal circumstances, their academic networks, and the guidance of their supervisors distinctly shape the formation of doctoral students' scientific identities. In Yogyakarta, for example, university proximity facilitates participation in interdisciplinary scientific communities. It is good that if they established of clear shared objectives, dynamic leadership, and a conducive environment for collaborative innovation, as these are prime prerequisites for building successful virtual communities of practice.<sup>56</sup>

### **Perceived Effects of Academic Communities Improved Scholarly Writing abilities**

Despite not being formally developed by their postgraduate programs, the academic communities affect the students during their doctoral programs. At JU1, according to a doctoral student, a lecturer was designated to guide doctoral students through various scholarly activities throughout the year. Students were invited to join the meetings. During an interview, a doctoral student remarked that his frequent attendance at the doctoral communities had opportunities to learn a lot of things, from looking for the research problem to writing for internationally reputed journals. After attending the meetings, he had been successfully published in a Q3 Scopus-indexed journal. Since then, he becomes confident to write academically by himself.<sup>57</sup>

The finding corroborate previous research findings that community engagement and resilience<sup>58</sup> among among curial factors that support the development of academic identity and study completion. Besides, the finding is aligned with existing study that Robert found that students joining their academic communities facilitated them to improve their understanding of research and writing as a way to develop their professional learning and scholarly identity development.<sup>59</sup> As has been proved in previous studies that the ability to effectively read and write in a scientific context is paramount for students during their doctoral process.<sup>60</sup>

---

<sup>56</sup> Huang, Hsin-Chi. "Enhancing doctoral learning through virtual communities of practice: an autoethnographic perspective." *Frontiers in Education*. Vol. 9. Frontiers Media SA, 2024.

<sup>57</sup> An interview with P2 of UJ2.

<sup>58</sup> Hermayawati, Hermayawati. "Analyzing the Doctoral Candidates' Level of Efforts to 'Leapfrog' Their Dissertation Accomplishment Needs." *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research* 24.2 (2025).

<sup>59</sup> Robert, Linds "'This Is Just What We Do': PhD students on becoming scholars..."

<sup>60</sup> Crawford, Caroline M. "The 10 'C' s towards authentically supporting doctoral students: gracefully and successfully supporting doctoral students towards completing the capstone experience." *Creating a Framework for Dissertation Preparation: Emerging Research and*

### Improved Understanding of Theories

In AU1, doctoral students were frequently informed and invited to meetings with visiting scholars. Additionally, they proactively formed communities to share ideas on their studies, thesis proposals, and other tasks. They frequently utilized university facilities for discussions and online tools, such as the WhatsApp app and email, to collaborate on various aspects of their work, from document sharing to problem-solving. Sometimes they shared experiences and financial difficulties with their group members.<sup>61</sup>

Similar practices were observed among doctoral students at AU2 in Aceh. They utilized online applications, such as WhatsApp Groups, to support their Community of Practice (CoP) in discussing their study progress, coursework, and more. Primarily, they focused on their assignments, followed by discussions on the theories relevant to their doctoral studies and the progress of their dissertations. Additionally, they addressed various challenges. During their meetings, they mostly discussed topics related to our dissertations, course assignments, and theories related to the courses. Sometimes, they also discussed family problems and other issues. Meeting their colleagues, they can freely express their problems as the community members are all in the same cohorts.

However, most doctoral students from AU1 reported working primarily within their small groups, such as cohorts enrolled in the doctoral program in Islamic religious education. Collaboration among students typically occurred only when required for group assignments. Interaction with doctoral students from other programs was infrequent during the process of scholarly identity development.

Based on the interview with JU1, despite the diversity of academic communities they participated in both within and outside their universities, students expressed that the communities are essential for addressing various academic and social issues. However, they recommended specific actions for postgraduate programs to enhance the impact of CoPs on their scholarly identity development. There were many important things that strongly affect their discussions in the meetings of our communities, such as training of scholarly writing by the postgraduate programs, training of research and scholarly writing by the libraries, meetings with visiting scholars, and serious guidance of supervisors.<sup>62</sup>

It can be understood from the narration of the doctoral students that they received substantial benefits from joining their community of practices, especially in enhancing their understanding of theories and their application in the students' doctoral research. The findings demonstrate that the role of postgraduate programs in supporting students' communities is paramount, especially in assigning a good

---

*Opportunities*. IGI Global, 2020. 98-127; Riches-Suman, Kirsten. "Supporting doctoral candidates through completion and final examination." *Encyclopedia* 4.2 (2024), p. 836-846.

<sup>61</sup> An interview with P1 of AU2.

<sup>62</sup> An interview with a doctoral student of JU1.

mentor. As has been argued by Wenger that experienced mentor play an important role in supporting the community of practice.<sup>63</sup>

### **Psychological Benefits**

Most doctoral students, male and female, across universities reported psychological benefits from participating in academic communities, such as reduced isolation, lower stress, and a decreased likelihood of discontinuing their studies. For example, one AU1 student considered withdrawing from her program due to doubts about her ability to complete her dissertation and her future career. Many times she was unable to meet the expectation. After sharing her concerns with colleagues in the doctoral community, she learned that many had similar experiences. Through long discussion and support from group members, she regained her motivation to continue her studies.<sup>64</sup>

Such emotional challenges and the intention to quit the doctoral program were also obvious in previous research findings. During their doctoral degree, candidates often experience various practical and emotional challenges as they work. Experienced supervisors are aware that this commonly happens to their students and hence provide valuable insights and support for their postgraduate students during this crucial time.<sup>65</sup> Besides, as found in several previous studies,<sup>66,67,68</sup> working in communities, conventional or virtual, can reduce students' feelings of anxiety, isolation, and loneliness during the journey to complete their programs.

### **Barriers to joining Academic Communities**

#### **Mums' Household Responsibility**

Although participation in academic communities offers various significant benefits, doctoral students, particularly women, experienced several barriers that limited their attendance at meetings. Nevertheless, not all female students felt restricted to attend the meetings of their communities. A female student undertaking a doctoral program in YU2 said that she had had a commitment with her husband that she needed to work all out to complete her study. She also attended a week group

---

<sup>63</sup> Wenger, E. *Communities of Practice: Learning, Meaning, and Identity*. Cambridge University Press, 1999.

<sup>64</sup> An interview with a doctoral student of AU1.

<sup>65</sup> Riches-Suman, Kirsten. "Supporting doctoral candidates through completion and final examination." *Encyclopedia* 4.2 (2024), p. 836-846.

<sup>66</sup> Hermayawati, Hermayawati. "Analyzing the Doctoral Candidates' Level of Efforts to 'Leapfrog' Their Dissertation Accomplishment Needs."

<sup>67</sup> Huang, Hsin-Chi. "Enhancing doctoral learning through virtual communities of practice: an autoethnographic perspective."

<sup>68</sup> L. H. Lassig, C. J., Dillon and C. M. Diezmann, "Student or Scholar? Transforming Identities through a Research Writing Group,"

excursion abroad to present and discuss her research progress and receive feedbacks from the host lecturers. To do so, she had received permission from her husband.<sup>69</sup>

However, there are some female students reported that their responsibilities as mothers and wives constrained the time available for engaging with their doctoral communities. For example, one interviewee explained that when she began her doctoral program, her young children were enrolled in primary school, which required her to spend most of her time at home providing care. As a result, she had limited opportunities to participate in academic community activities, despite recognizing their importance for her studies. She emphasized that, as a mother, her primary focus was on her family.<sup>70</sup> Consequently, household responsibilities frequently prevented female doctoral students from attending community events. Societal expectations often place the burden of domestic chores on women, even when they have spouses.

All these accounts of female doctoral students indicate that not all mums' doctoral students felt challenged to join their academic communities during their doctoral process. Nevertheless, in a patriarchal society like Indonesia, a commitment of their husband to support their wives strongly affects their involvement in their academic communities. As found in previous research that even though mums often experienced difficulties during their doctoral programs, they can bring a range of skills and attributes that are valuable to individual doctoral studies.<sup>71</sup>

### **Full-time Employees**

Another female student also mentioned wanting to join the communities more often. However, most doctoral students are full-time employees, including teachers, school principals, and homemakers, and many live far from campus. Those residing kilometers away typically come only for in-person courses, while those with demanding jobs come on weekends or after work hours. These factors, along with the impact of COVID-19, posed significant barriers to developing their scholarly identity. As a result, they had limited opportunities to engage on campus, share ideas, or learn how to become scholars in their fields. In the same vein, a doctoral student in JU1 described a similar issue with joining academic communities. Studying in Jakarta allows him to take study leave and focus on his dissertation every day. In contrast, students from Jakarta and its surrounding areas are mostly full-time workers with limited time to participate in our community.

The findings indicate that maintaining focus is essential for successfully completing a doctoral program and developing an academic identity among both

---

<sup>69</sup> An interview with a female doctoral student of YU1.

<sup>70</sup> An interview with a female doctoral student of AU1

<sup>71</sup> Mason, Shannon, Melissa Bond, and Susan Ledger. "How motherhood enhances and strains doctoral research/ers." *Journal of Further and Higher Education* 47.8 (2023), p. 1087-1105.

male and female students. Employment in a full-time position may divert doctoral students' attention and diminish their efforts toward identity development.<sup>72</sup> In this regard, Therefore, it is important for doctoral students to prioritize their daily tasks and incorporate essential skills, including time management, critical analysis, academic writing, and information synthesis.

### **COVID-19**

Some students shared that COVID-19 made it harder for them to become part of their communities. The COVID pandemic, especially from 2020 to mid-2022, made it difficult for doctoral students to join their academic communities. Interviews with students show that those at AU1<sup>73</sup> and AU2<sup>74</sup> found the outbreak to be their biggest challenge, as it kept them apart during their programs. When universities closed, and classes moved online, students could no longer meet face-to-face and could only discuss limited topics related to their studies. All university rooms were closed, and supervision took place online. Learning facilities were unavailable and replaced with online options. As a result, students and supervisors met online or sometimes outside the campus.

However, some students kept doing their doctoral programs and improve their professionalism during the COVID-19. It was not an easy task during that time. Their family support strongly motivate them to complete their doctoral program. This indicates that motivation strongly affects students' intention and resilience to keep on completing their programs. Comparable findings indicate that online communities can enhance academic networking, improve knowledge management, and support the mental well-being of remote learners.<sup>75</sup>

### **Supervisors' Availability**

Another challenge is the limited time of supervisors, as many are occupied with daily responsibilities. Lecturers in Indonesian higher education often face heavy administrative workloads, which reduces their focus on academic tasks such as supervising and mentoring doctoral students. The frequent inavailability of supervisors determines the journey of the students' academic identity development. As a result, one student sought guidance from another university for research and academic writing support.<sup>76</sup>

---

<sup>72</sup> Hermayawati, Hermayawati. "Analyzing the Doctoral Candidates' Level of Efforts to 'Leapfrog' Their Dissertation Accomplishment Needs."

<sup>73</sup> An interview with a student of AU1.

<sup>74</sup> An interview with a student of AU2.

<sup>75</sup> Huang, Hsin-Chi. "Enhancing doctoral learning through virtual communities of practice: an autoethnographic perspective."

<sup>76</sup> An interview with a doctoral student.

The findings show that when supervisors and experienced members, known as 'old timers' by Wenger,<sup>77</sup> are absent, opportunities for interactions, guided discussion, and idea sharing are limited. As found in previous study, experienced supervisors' insight is still crucial during the students' identity development even though they have been highly motivated.<sup>78</sup> Therefore, postgraduate programs need to ensure qualified supervisors' availability and the doctoral student communities for supporting doctoral students to complete their doctoral program and reach academic identity.

## Conclusion

This study has delved into the experiences of doctoral students in joining their academic communities during their path to becoming scholars in the patriarchal society. The research findings conclude that doctoral students' ways of joining their doctoral communities in developing their scholarly identity can be grouped into core members and periphery ones. The participation of male and female students in the communities depends on their situation. However, the learning communities were informally established by the students themselves as they need to interact with each other during their doctoral programs. They function effectively when they receive strong support from postgraduate programs. Besides, although learning communities were perceived as essential, not all doctoral students felt adequately supported during their candidacy due to various challenges, including heavy workloads as employees, living distance from campus, the Covid-19 pandemic, and limited availability of their supervisors. To facilitate the transition of doctoral students into scholars upon graduation, each university must prioritize the development of a vibrant doctoral student community. Written policies should be established, socialized, implemented, and evaluated annually to ensure they provide effective support for students in cultivating their scholarly identity. Additionally, financial resources should be allocated to assist in the development of students' learning communities. It is important to note that while this study was merely conducted across six Indonesian universities, it did not investigate the relationship between supervisors and students concerning the students' scholarly development. Further research is warranted to explore additional factors that influence the scholarly identity of doctoral students.

---

<sup>77</sup> Wenger, E. *Communities of Practice: Learning, Meaning, and Identity*. Cambridge University Press, 1999.

<sup>78</sup> Riches-Suman, Kirsten. "Supporting doctoral candidates through completion and final examination

## References

### Journals and Books

- Abetz, Jenna S. "“I Want to Be Both, but Is That Possible?”: Communicating Mother-Scholar Uncertainty During Doctoral Candidacy.” *Journal of Women and Gender in Higher Education* 12, no. 1 (2019): 70–87. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19407882.2018.1501582>.
- Ali, Azad, and Frederick G Kohun. “Cultural Influence on Social Isolation in Doctoral Programs and Doctoral Attrition-A Case Study.” *Information Systems Education Journal* 7, no. 64 (2009): 2–7. <http://isedj.org/7/64/>.
- Amraeni, Yunita, Sudijanto Kamso, Sabarinah B. Prasetyo, and Muhammad Nirwan. “A Matriarchal and Patriarchal Perception on Women’s Autonomy in Decision Making on Contraception: Qualitative Analysis in Indonesia.” *Malaysian Journal of Medicine and Health Sciences* 17 (2021): 17–21.
- Baharudin, Rahmawati. "Patrarkhi dalam Sistem Keluarga Muslim Tradisional." *Ijtihad: Jurnal Wacana Hukum Islam dan Kemanusiaan* 10.1 (2010).
- Berry, Sharla. “Student Support Networks in Online Doctoral Programs: Exploring Nested Communities.” *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 12 (2017): 33–48. <https://doi.org/10.28945/3676>.
- . “Teaching to Connect: Community-Building Strategies for the Virtual Classroom.” *Online Learning Journal* 23, no. 1 (2019): 164–83. <https://doi.org/10.24059/olj.v23i1.1425>.
- Braun, V., and V. Clarke. “Thematic Analysis Revised.” *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling* 53, no. 9 (2019).
- Burrow, Lauren E., Chrissy J. Cross, Heather K. Olson Beal, and Shaunna Smith. “The Skits, Sketches, and Stories of MotherScholars.” *Qualitative Report* 25, no. 12 (2020): 4245–73. <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2020.4520>.
- Connelly, F. M., and D. J. Clandinin. *Shaping a Professional Identity: Stories of Education Practice*. Althouse Press, 1999.
- Craig, Cheryl J. “Metaphors of Knowing, Doing and Being: Capturing Experience in Teaching and Teacher Education.” *Teaching and Teacher Education* 69 (2018): 300–311. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2017.09.011>.
- Crawford, Caroline M. "The 10 “C” s towards authentically supporting doctoral students: gracefully and successfully supporting doctoral students towards completing the capstone experience." *Creating a Framework for Dissertation Preparation: Emerging Research and Opportunities*. IGI Global, 2020. 98-127.
- Crow, G. M., and J. Møller. “Professional-Identities-of-School-Leaders-across-International-Contexts.” *Educational Management Administration & Leadership* 45, no. 5 (2017).
- Drouin, Michelle A. “The Relationship between Students’ Perceived Sense of Community and Satisfaction, Achievement, and Retention in an Online

- Course.” *Quarterly Review of Distance Education* 9, no. 3 (2008).
- Ernanda, Ernanda. “Challenging the Patriarchal Culture; Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis of the Indonesian Environmental Heroines.” *Wacana* 24, no. 1 (2023). <https://doi.org/10.17510/WACANA.V24I1.1173>.
- Ford, Emily. “Tell Me Your Story: Narrative Inquiry in LIS Research.” *College and Research Libraries* 81, no. 2 (2020). <https://doi.org/10.5860/crl.81.2.235>.
- Gee, J.P. “Self-Fashioning and Shape-Shifting: Language, Identity, and Social Class.” In *Reconceptualizing the Literacies in Adolescents’ Lives*, edited by S. F. Phelps & D. R. Waff D. E. Alvermann, I. A. Hinchman, D. W. Moore, 2nd ed., 165–85, 2006. <https://psycnet.apa.org/record/2006-05037-009>.
- Hazell, Cassie M., Laura Chapman, Sophie F. Valeix, Paul Roberts, Jeremy E. Niven, and Clio Berry. “Understanding the Mental Health of Doctoral Researchers: A Mixed Methods Systematic Review with Meta-Analysis and Meta-Synthesis.” *Systematic Reviews* 9, no. 1 (2020): 1–30. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13643-020-01443-1>.
- Hermayawati, Hermayawati. "Analyzing the Doctoral Candidates’ Level of Efforts to ‘Leapfrog’ Their Dissertation Accomplishment Needs." *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research* 24.2 (2025).
- Huang, Hsin-Chi. "Enhancing doctoral learning through virtual communities of practice: an autoethnographic perspective." *Frontiers in Education*. Vol. 9. Frontiers Media SA, 2024.
- Inouye, Kelsey, and Lynn McAlpine. “Developing Academic Identity: A Review of the Literature on Doctoral Writing and Feedback.” *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 14 (2019): 1–31. <https://doi.org/10.28945/4168>.
- Inouye, Kelsey S., and Lynn McAlpine. “Developing Scholarly Identity: Variation in Agentive Responses to Supervisor Feedback.” *Journal of University Teaching and Learning Practice* 14, no. 2 (2017). <https://doi.org/10.53761/1.14.2.3>.
- Jones, Michael. “Issues in Doctoral Studies -Forty Years of Journal Discussion: Where Have We Been and Where Are We Going?” *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 8 (2013): 83–104. <https://doi.org/10.28945/1871>.
- Kamler, B., and P. Thomson. *Helping Doctoral Students Write: Pedagogies for Supervision*. 2nd ed. Taylor and Francis, 2014.
- Kennedy, Donna H, Steven R Terrell, Michael Lohle, and D H Kennedy. “The Qualitative Report A Grounded Theory of Persistence in a Limited-Residency Doctoral Program Recommended APA Citation” 20 (2015): 3–9. <http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR20/3/kennedy4.pdf>.
- Lassig, C. J., Dillon, L. H., and C. M. Diezmann. “Student or Scholar? Transforming Identities through a Research Writing Group.” *Studies in Continuing Education* 35, no. 3 (2013).
- Lave, J., and E. Wenger. *Situated Learning: Legitimate Peripheral Participation*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991.
- LeBlanc, S. S., Spradley, E., Beal, H. O., Burrow, L., and C. Cross. “Being Dr. Mom

- and/or Mom, Ph.D.: Autoethnographies of MotherScholaring during COVID-19.” *New Horizons in Adult Education and Human Resource Development* 34, no. 3 (2022).
- Leshem, Shosh. “Identity Formations of Doctoral Students on the Route to Achieving Their Doctorate.” *Issues in Educational Research* 30, no. 1 (2020).
- Lochmiller, C. R. “Conducting Thematic Analysis with Qualitative Data.” *The Qualitative Report* 26, no. 6 (2021).  
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2021.5008>.
- Lovitts, Barbara E. “Being a Good Course-Taker Is Not Enough: A Theoretical Perspective on the Transition to Independent Research.” *Studies in Higher Education* 30, no. 2 (2005): 137–54.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/03075070500043093>.
- Mason, Shannon, Melissa Bond, Susan Ledger. “How Motherhood Enhances and Strains Doctoral Research/Ers.” *Journal of Further and Higher Education* 47, no. 8 (2023).
- McCluskey-Dean, Clare. “Identifying and Facilitating a Community of Practice in Inormation Literacy in Higher Education.” *A PhD Thesis*. Robert Gordon University, 2020.
- Mercieca, B. “What Is a Community of Practice?” In *Communities of Practice*, edited by A. McDonald, J., Cater-Steel, 2–25. Singapore: Springer, 2017.  
[https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-10-2879-3\\_1](https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-10-2879-3_1).
- Mirick, R., and S. Wladkowski. “Women’s Experiences with Parenting during Doctoral Education.” *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 15 (2008).
- Nilan, Pam, and Argyo Demartoto. “Patriarchal Residues in Indonesia: Respect Accorded Senior Men by Junior Men.” *European Journal of Social Sciences* 31, no. 2 (2012).
- Park, John Jongho, and iane L. Schallert. “Reciprocity between Doctoral Students’ Emerging Professional Identity and Their Envisionment of a Possible Future Self in Real and Imagined Communities of Practice.” *Learning, Culture and Social Interaction Volume 26, September 2020, 100434* 26 (2020).
- Pham, Duc Huu. “The Professional Development of Academic Staff in Higher Education Institution.” *Journal of Teacher Education for Sustainability* 23, no. 1 (2021): 115–31. <https://doi.org/10.2478/jtes-2021-0009>.
- Riches-Suman, Kirsten. "Supporting doctoral candidates through completion and final examination." *Encyclopedia* 4.2 (2024).
- Riessman, Catherine Kohler. *Narrative methods for the human sciences*. Sage, 2008.
- Roberts, Linds. ““This Is Just What We Do’: PhD Students on Becoming Scholars in a Community of Practice.” *Communications in Information Literacy* 15, no. 1 (2021): 75–94. <https://doi.org/10.15760/comminfolit.2021.15.1.4>.
- Rockinson-Szapkiw, Amanda; Spaulding, Lucinda S.; Lunde, Rebecca. “Women in Distance Doctoral Programs: How They Negotiate Their Identities as Mothers, Professionals, and Academics in Order to Persist.” *International Journal of Doctoral Studies* 12 (2017): 49–71.

- Rockinson-Szapkiw, Amanda, and Jessica Herring Watson. "Academic-Family Integration: How Do Men and Women in Distance Education and Residential Doctoral Programs Integrate Their Degree and Family?" *Online Learning Journal* 24, no. 4 (2020): 112–30. <https://doi.org/10.24059/olj.v24i4.2318>.
- Rooij, E. van, M. Fokkens-Bruinsma, and E. Jansen. "Factors That Influence PhD Candidates' Success: The Importance of PhD Project Characteristics." *Studies in Continuing Education* 43, no. 1 (2021): 48–67. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0158037X.2019.1652158>.
- Singelis, T. M. Brown, W. J. "Culture, Self, and Collectivist Communication: Linking Culture to Individual Behavior." *Human Communication Research* 21, no. 3 (1995).
- Splitter, L.J. "What Identity Really Is and Why It Matters." In *Identity, Reasonableness and Being One among Others*, 7–30, 2023. [https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-19-6684-2\\_2](https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-19-6684-2_2).
- Stubb, J., K. Pyhältö, and K. Lonka. "Balancing between Inspiration and Exhaustion: PhD Students' Experienced Socio-Psychological Well-Being." *Studies in Continuing Education* 33, no. 1 (2011).
- Subedi, Khim Raj, Shyam Sharma, and Krishna Bista. "Academic Identity Development of Doctoral Scholars in an Online Writing Group." *Intenational Journal of Doctoral Studies* 17 (2022).
- Tan, C. P., Van der Molen, H. T., Schmidt, H. G. "A Measure of Professional Identity Development for Professional Education." *Studies in Higher Education* 42, no. 8 (2017).
- Tracy, Sarah J. *Qualitative Research Methods: Collecting Evidence, Crafting Analysis, Communicating Impact*. John Wiley & Sons, 2024.
- Tseng, Fan Chuan, and Feng Yang Kuo. "A Study of Social Participation and Knowledge Sharing in the Teachers' Online Professional Community of Practice." *Computers and Education* 72 (2014). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2013.10.005>.
- Wahidah, Evita Yuliatul, Sangkot Sirait, and Erika Setyanti Kusumaputri. "Doctoral Student Experiences in Indonesian Postgraduate Programs: A Phenomenological Investigation of Challenges." *AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan* 15.4 (2023).
- Wenger, E. *Communities of Practice: Learning, Meaning, and Identity*. Cambridge University Press, 1999.
- . *Communities of Practice: Learning, Meaning, and Identity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999.
- Yalango, Kimberlee. "'Stretched Thin': Pregnancy and Motherhood in Clinical and Counseling Psychology Doctoral Programs." University of Denver, 2019.
- Zimmerman, Aaron Samuel, and Jeong-Hee Kim. "Excavating and (Re)Presenting Stories: Narrative Inquiry as an Emergent Methodology in the Field of Adult Vocational Education and Technology." *International Journal of Adult Vocational Education and Technology (IJAVET)* 8, no. 2 (2022).

## **Interviews**

Interview with a doctoral student of JU1.

Interview with a female doctoral student of AU1

Interview with a female doctoral student of YU1.

Interview with a student of AU1.

Interview with a student of AU2.

Interview with P1 of AU1

Interview with P1 of AU2.

Interview with P5 of YU2.

Interview with participants of AU1, AU2, JU1, JU2, YU1, and YU2